

Evaluating Training and Apprenticeship as Non-Formal Education at International Manpower Development Japan

Edi Waryono*, Masduki Ahmad, Desi Rahmawati

Education Management, Universitas Negeri Jakarta *Corresponding Author. Email: <u>waryono_edi@yahoo.com</u>

Abstract: This study aims to analyze the evaluation results of the implementation of training and apprenticeships at IM Japan. This study used a qualitative approach using the CIPP (context, input, process, and product) model. The number of participants was 150 from Bekasi, West Java, Lampung, and Central Java. Data collection techniques used observation, interviews, and documents. Data analysis in this study went through data reduction, data presentation, discussion, and conclusion. The findings showed that the context and input aspects were considered quite good, with a percentage value of 22% each; the process aspect was considered very good, with a percentage rate of 49%, and the product aspect must be improved in alumni associations so that they could develop networks for alumni or participants training and apprenticeship related to workforce needs. The results of this study have implications that the process of non-formal education is an essential support for students, especially students in vocational schools so that their skills are qualified and meet the quality targets of the business world.

Article History

Received: 16-01-2023 Revised: 20-02-2023 Accepted: 12-03-2023 Published: 07-04-2023

Key Words: Evaluation; Training and Apprenticeship; Non-formal Education; CIPP.

How to Cite: Waryono, E., Ahmad, M., & Rahmawati, D. (2023). Evaluating Training and Apprenticeship as Non-Formal Education at International Manpower Development Japan. *Jurnal Paedagogy*, *10*(2), 320-329. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.33394/jp.v10i2.6994</u>

https://doi.org/10.33394/jp.v10i2.6994

This is an open-access article under the CC-BY-SA License.



Introduction

Training and apprenticeship programs are non-formal education activities that can be held by various non-formal educational institutions (Ivanova, 2017a; Khasnabis & Motsch, 2010). One of them is the International Manpower Development Japan (IMD Japan) agency, which collaborates with the Ministry of Manpower to develop human resources through an overseas internship scheme. IM Japan provides various training and apprenticeships for school graduates in Indonesia interested in working in Japan. Currently, Indonesia is also developing a training function that is taught to prospective apprentices. The Ministry of Manpower uses this training to prepare prospective domestic and foreign apprentices. Jenderal Sudirman University has implemented industrial internships from the world of education in Purwokerto. Jenderal Sudirman University has now collaborated with the industrial world in Japan as a place for student internships. The campus has benefited from the internship program; students are more independent and better prepared to work or become entrepreneurs (Adi, 2020). So, training and apprenticeship activities are not only used as nonformal education, but educational institutions can organize training and apprenticeship programs for students to support certifying graduates' abilities.

Moreover, the education policy was proclaimed by the Ministry of Education and Culture regarding independent learning. This policy was taken as a form of improving the quality of human resources, especially graduates or students (Tohir, 2020; Sopiansyah & Masruroh, 2021). So, this training and apprenticeship program is very relevant to the current independent curriculum policy. Schools can cooperate with non-formal educational



institutions, government or private, related to the need for training or apprenticeship activities. Even students in tertiary institutions can take credits for outside internships related to the expertise of their respective study programs.

Another reason for implementing these training and apprenticeship activities is to deal with the gap between education in schools and what companies need. Moreover, students studying at the vocational level must have qualified expertise according to the needs of the industrial world. Students can improve these abilities through internships in the Field Work Program. However, graduates of vocational schools can still gain technical skills through various training and apprenticeship programs. Especially now, the government has made a policy that vocational education graduates must have expertise certification that is by the world of work by the standards set by the government. This determination is related to the needs and demands for the quality of human resources in the current global era (Lase, 2019; Kadarisman, 2011). It means that the current process of formal and non-formal education must be able to meet global needs.

IM Japan answered this challenge and collaborated with the Ministry of Manpower to develop human resources through an overseas internship scheme. Thus, graduates or workers in Indonesia can compete abroad. IM Japan has been the official pioneer of apprenticeship in Japan since 1993. This collaboration has created a mutually beneficial agreement between Indonesia and Japan to distribute skilled human resources. The results of observations at IM Japan show that there is quite high interest from the Indonesian people to take part in training and education as well as apprenticeships to Japan from 2017 to 2020. Moreover, graduates have just graduated from vocational schools. However, during the Covid-19 pandemic from 2020 to 2021, there were obstacles related to activity restrictions. However, at the beginning of 2022, education, training, and apprenticeship activities gradually returned to normal, and the participants were very enthusiastic about carrying out these activities.

This apprenticeship program to Japan is organized to absorb knowledge, knowledge, and skills through work activities in industries/companies in Japan (Fadilah & Fakhruddin, 2019). Previous research stated that the success of training has stages that are by standard operating procedure (Darmawan, 2017). It means the training must have qualified innovation (Dostie, 2017). That is because training can have a positive impact on business production and welfare (Jaworski, Ravichandran, Karpinski, & Singh, 2018 Khan et al., 2016). So, to increase the effectiveness of training programs, it is necessary to improve the quality of service and the placement of workers (Adhif et al., 2017). In addition, the current trend of graduates from the provision of education must be able to adapt to the needs of the world of work (Galvão et al., 2018), so that many educational institutions collaborate in science to achieve these conditions (Secundo et al., 2019).

From the explanation of the results of previous observations and research, implementing training and apprenticeships is of great interest to today's society. Because the process of formal education has also facilitated apprenticeship activities or various pieces of training as a form of increasing student competence. IM Japan, as a non-formal educational institution, also provides skills improvement needs that are intended to be able to work in Japan. Therefore, this training and apprenticeship activity has an educational curriculum that is appropriate to the process of providing education to achieve the goal. Therefore, this research is focused on evaluating the implementation of training and apprenticeship using the CIPP model. It is effective to evaluate the education program (Mahmudi, 2011; Marsidi et al., 2020; Warju, 2016) This analysis was conducted to determine the success and mapping of the non-formal education curriculum.



Moreover, research that focuses on this problem has not been studied much because previous research has often aimed at evaluating the implementation of training in formal education institutions. At the same time, this study presents a different concept because of the evaluation of the implementation of training and apprenticeships in non-formal education institutions, which produce skilled graduates who are ready to work. However, IM Japan builds this training and apprenticeship organization with a curriculum relevant to current developments and government regulations. The reason for conducting this research is so that the training and apprenticeship organized by IM Japan can be aligned with the concept of increasing students' competence in formal educational institutions such as vocational schools. So, the purpose of this study was to find out the results of evaluating the implementation of training and apprenticeships at IM Japan using the CIPP model. The results of this study can be used as a guideline for developing training and apprenticeship curricula in non-formal educational institutions.

Research Method

The qualitative research approach used the CIPP (context, input, process, and product) model evaluation method. The qualitative research aims to interpret phenomena that occur in the field, and researchers are the primary instruments (Creswell & Creswell, 2018). This research was conducted at IM Japan at IM Japan in Bekasi, West Java, Lampung, and Central Java. The procedures followed were by the CIPP evaluation model concept (Stufflebeam & Coryn, 2014). Context evaluation assesses needs, problems, and opportunities as a foundation for goal setting. As a tool for program planning and resource allocation, input evaluation evaluates alternative approaches to meeting learning needs. Process evaluation assesses the implementation and then assists in explaining the results. Product evaluation identifies desired and undesirable outcomes to help keep processes on track and determine effectiveness.

The technique of determining the sampling used total sampling because the entire population was used as a sample. There were 150 participants taken from Bekasi, West Java, Lampung, and Central Java. Data collection techniques used observation, interviews, and documents. Observations were made to see the process of organizing training and apprenticeships at IM Japan. Researchers made direct observations in three places to find out how to organize training and apprenticeships at IM Japan. Interviews were conducted with IM Japan's leadership to learn more about training and apprenticeship management from planning and implementation to evaluation. The document was taken from the report on implementing training and apprenticeship at IM Japan. Data was taken during the period 2021-2022.

Data analysis in this study went through data reduction, data presentation, discussion, and conclusion (Miles et al., 2014). The data analysis steps are as follows.

- 1) Data reduction was carried out for the data selection process. After all the data was collected, the researcher made a settlement, whether the collected data could be processed or not. Then, it was separated which data could be used and which data could not be used.
- 2) The presentation of data was done through the process of data tabulation. In data tabulation activities, researchers carried out three steps, namely the activity of making or providing the necessary table rows according to needs, entering each alternative answer for each question item and each respondent, and the third step was the activity



of calculating the frequency of alternative answers for each item and alternative answer. Then, conclude the data that has been analyzed.

Results and Discussion

The results of data analysis were about training and apprenticeship in International Manpower Development Japan using the CIPP model and were presented in the following table;

	Table 1. Finding of Evaluating Training and Apprenticeship in IM Japan			
No	CIPP Components		Finding	Implemented (%)
1	Context	1.	The school program environment is reflected in the vision and mission, implementation of education and training.	22%
		2.	Background of program implementation and objectives	
		3.	The legal basis for implementation as a blueprint program.	
		4.	IM Japan education and training guidelines	
		5.	Coverage of the population served	
2	Input	1.	The curriculum used, curriculum development, and curriculum guidelines are adapted to the quality demands of the industrial and global world.	22%
		2.	Competence of instructors who educate and train IM Japan education and training participants in the training center	
		3.	The facilities and markets used by IM Japan	
		4.	Sources of funds are used to support IM Japan's education and training.	
3	Process	1.	The instructor's duties and responsibilities include dividing instructor assignments, and implementing the curriculum in stage one and stage training	49%
		2.	IM Japan's special learning model, namely the application of a knockout system at every stage of education and training	
		3.	Monitoring from IM Japan Center and the Ministry of Manpower	
		4.	Specific learning media is to support certain skill abilities needed by companies receiving apprenticeships in Japan	
		5.	Evaluate the obstacles in the pre-apprentice training at IM Japan Indonesia.	
4	Product	1.	Evaluation of updated training and education products	7%
		2.	Internship opportunity in Japan	
		3.	Economic benefits for Japanese apprentices	
		4.	Work placement	
		5.	Alumni organization	
			0	

Table 1 is this overview of each aspect of the CIPP model. The table explains that the level of the process carried out by IM Development Japan is very good and structured. At the same time, the aspect that must be improved is the product aspect. However, documents tracing the whereabouts of alumni show that Japanese apprentice alumni who returned to



Indonesia used various career opportunities, such as working in Japanese companies, starting businesses, and working in Japan again. The context aspect is by applicable regulations, and the input has data that is quite accurate according to the standard operational regulations for training and apprenticeship activities and legal entities. The input aspect has also been considered quite good and must constantly be updated according to developments in the needs of the industrial world.

The findings on the context aspect illustrate that IM Japan organizes non-formal education such as training and apprenticeships for high school graduates by established legality. The legal basis includes laws, government regulations and a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between the Directorate General of Binalattas, the Ministry of Manpower of the Republic of Indonesia and the International Manpower Development Organization Japan (IM Japan). The background of the program focuses on efforts to improve the quality and quality of Indonesia's human resources. The education and training guidelines that are organized have a systematic structure that covers both the curriculum and teaching guides. So, IM Japan's background describes participation between the government and the private sector as part of the community in education (Ewelum & Ugochukwu, 2016; Fauziah et al., 2021). Implementing this non-formal education is one of the answers to the global challenges to the quality of graduates from schools or tertiary institutions. Even non-formal education answers the needs of students' life skills (Alifuddin, 2017; Wildemeersch, 2016). Thus, the results of this study are also in line with the understanding that non-formal education as part of general education provides students with the necessary tools for cognition and creativity. It allows them to fully realize their potential and set their professional and personal goals (Ivanova, 2017b). Non-formal education is also not only developed in Indonesia, even in Thailand, it has also become a unit. The transformation of non-formal and informal education becomes an integral part of the National Education System in macro settings and macro areas (Fauziah et al., 2021).

The findings on the input aspect have also been assessed as quite good. IM Japan designed the implementation of non-formal education as part of complementing formal education. The designed training and apprenticeship also have operational standards relevant to current developments. Even though the curriculum used is adapted to the skills needs of the current world of work, as well as the competence of the instructors, the facilities and funds provided are systematically carried out properly. So, non-formal education is a factor that can contribute to the quality of school graduates. Moreover, many factors contribute to the link between school and workplace learning, including collaboration and disengaged communication across learning sites and factors related to curriculum development and instructional settings (Sappa et al., 2018). It means that schools, government, and formal and non-formal private institutions should be able to collaborate to improve the quality of graduates. In Germany, a Dual Apprenticeship System represents a high level of institutional collaboration. However, enterprises and vocational schools at the meso level (institutional level and actor level), in contrast, are loosely coupled with dominant partners (ie companies) and subordinate partners (ie, vocational schools) (Gessler, 2017; Sappa & Aprea, 2014). In Switzerland, an initial vocational education and training partnership (IVET) was also carried out from the perspective of several stakeholders in the field. Collaboration between stakeholders is essential in dual IVET to link school and workplace-based learning and ensure the system's overall quality. However, such collaboration can be challenging, given the different epistemic nature of training schools and companies. Apprentices, who regularly cross the boundaries of vocational schools and training establishments, often need help to



connect the learning they gain from the two places (Sauli, 2021; -Tarazona et al., 2022; Vlassopoulos et al., 2022).

From this explanation, process factors are essential to achieving training and apprenticeship goals. That is because IM Japan's institutions must design a quality system starting from learning models, monitoring, monitoring, learning media, and evaluating training and apprenticeships, which are carried out regularly. The results of in-depth data analysis show that IM Japan's process aspects are very good. They have a planning system for a systematic evaluation. It means there is a guarantee of a quality assurance system in the delivery of education, which is an indicator for measuring the results of quality education. This process was carried out by various countries such as Indonesia, China, Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, and others (Beerkens & Udam, 2017; Chowdhury et al., 2013; Fathurrohman, 2019; Krouglov, 2017; Pannen, 2019; Safadi & Vlachopoulos, 2021; Wang, 2014).

The success of IM Japan's non-formal education process illustrates how products such as the quality of students fit global needs. However, there are areas for improvement, namely, increasing alumni networks in career development or absorption in the business world. It can be understood from the analysis of the product section regarding the selection of alumni data which is still small. Institutions do not map data on alumni who have been successful or have careers or data on alumni who experience difficulties in self-development at work. It means that institutions should use alumni data to improve the quality of training and education. However, the level of active participation is quite good and much in demand. Document analysis found that in 2021 IM Japan educated 459 regular students and 59 caregiver students from Central Java, West Java, South Sumatra, and Bangka Belitung. In 2022 IM Japan educated and trained 1664 regular and 275 caregiver students. Students come from Central Java, East Java, West Nusa Tenggara, West Java, South Sumatra, Jambi, Medan, West Kalimantan, Makassar and Palu. So, there is very high interest in training and apprenticeship programs at IM Japan because they can fulfill the competencies of the current global era, especially for industry needs (Eichhorst et al., 2015; McGrath et al., 2019). Besides, it gave the occupational mobility needs after graduation (Abdel-Wahab, 2012; Jørgensen et al., 2018; Klatt et al., 2017; Mueller & Schweri, 2015).

The form of implementing non-formal education is training and apprenticeships, which the MoU holds with the Indonesian government. IM Japan is aimed at students at vocational schools or high school graduates who need to improve their skills, especially those who want to work abroad, like in Japan. IM Japan's education and training system adopts more of the training applied in the country. IM Japan applies this solely for general standardization, focusing on managing Japanese language education and building character through strict disciplinary training.

Conclusion

The results of the data analysis conclude that IM Development Japan has a fairly good nonformal education delivery system and follows the regulations that apply both in terms of internal regulations and the Indonesian government. The percentage of each aspect in CIPP from all the data that has been analyzed, namely the context and input aspects, have been considered quite good, with a percentage value of 22% each. The process aspect is considered very good with a percentage level of 49%, and the process aspect is considered very good with a percentage of 49%. The products must be increased in alumni associations so that they can develop networks for alumni or training participants and apprentices related to workforce needs.



Recommendation

The results of this study have implications that the process of non-formal education is an essential support for students, especially students in vocational schools, so that their skills are qualified and meet the quality targets of the business world. The research results recommend IM Japan related to alumni data who have graduated from IM Japan so that the institution has alumni career advancement developments. It can be used as input or input to improve the quality of training and education implementation. In addition, IM Japan can also take advantage of research results to improve professional trainers from the data entered by identified alumni, because alumni are workers who face the challenges of the world of work. For further research, they can develop the results of this research on the impact of training and apprenticeships on the application of labor in Japan and the career development of Japanese IM graduates in Indonesia.

References

- Abdel-Wahab, M. (2012). Rethinking apprenticeship training in the British construction industry. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 64(2), 145–154. https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2011.622450
- Adhif, M., Candra, A., Sulandari, S., Profesor, J., & Soedarto, H. (2017). EFEKTIVITAS PROGRAM PELATIHAN DALAM UPTD BALAI LATIHAN KERJA DINAS TENAGA KERJA TRANSMIGRASI DAN SOSIAL KABUPATEN BLORA. Journal of Public Policy and Management Review, 6(3), 145–153. https://doi.org/10.14710/JPPMR.V6I3.16684
- Adi, Y. (2020). Mahasiswa Unsoed Magang Industri. RRI Purwokerto.
- Alifuddin, Moh. (2017). Empowering Non-Formal Education Policy on Life Skills and Its Implications on People Welfare. *Journal of Education and Learning (EduLearn)*, 11(2), 165–171. https://doi.org/10.11591/EDULEARN.V11I2.5863
- Beerkens, M., & Udam, M. (2017). Stakeholders in Higher Education Quality Assurance: Richness in Diversity? *Higher Education Policy 2017 30:3*, 30(3), 341–359. https://doi.org/10.1057/S41307-016-0032-6
- Chowdhury, H., Alam, F., Biswas, S. K., Islam, M. T., & Islam, A. K. M. S. (2013). Quality Assurance and Accreditation of Engineering Education in Bangladesh. *Procedia Engineering*, 56, 864–869. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.PROENG.2013.03.208
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches fifth edition.* SAGE Publications Inc.
- Darmawan, D. (2017). PENERAPAN MODEL PELATIHAN ON THE JOB TRAINING (MAGANG) DALAM PELATIHAN OTOMOTIF YANG DI SELENGGARAKAN OLEH BALAI PELAYANAN PENDIDIKAN NONFORMAL PROVINSI BANTEN. Jurnal Eksistensi Pendidikan Luar Sekolah (E-Plus), 2(2). https://doi.org/10.30870/E-PLUS.V2I2.2957
- Dostie, B. (2017). The Impact of Training on Innovation. *Https://Doi.Org/10.1177/0019793917701116*, 71(1), 64–87. https://doi.org/10.1177/0019793917701116
- Eichhorst, W., Rodríguez-Planas, N., Schmidl, R., & Zimermann, K. F. (2015). A road map to vocational education and training in industrialized countries. *Industrial and*



Labor Relations Review, 68(2), 314–337. https://doi.org/10.1177/0019793914564963

- Ewelum, J. N., & Ugochukwu, M. K. (2016). Community Involvement/Participation In Nigerian Educational System: The Role Of Adult And Non-Formal Education. *The International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Invention*, 3(3), 2284– 2291.
- Fadilah, A. A., & Fakhruddin, F. (2019). MANAJEMEN PEMBELAJARAN PADA PELATIHAN PERSIAPAN PROGRAM MAGANG KE JEPANG DI LEMBAGA PELATIHAN KERJA (LPK) WAKASHIO GAKKOU BATANG. Journal of Nonformal Education and Community Empowerment, 3(2), 148–159

Fathurrohman, M. (2019). Quality Assurance di Lembaga Pendidikan. Kalimedia.

- Fauziah, P., Suryono, Y., Prasetyo, I., & Bariboon, G. (2021). Comparative Study on the Policy and Implementation of Non-Formal Education in Indonesia and Thailand. *KnE Social Sciences*, 330–338. https://doi.org/10.18502/KSS.V5I6.9221
- Galvão, A., Ferreira, J. J., & Marques, C. (2018). Entrepreneurship education and training as facilitators of regional development: A systematic literature review. *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development*, 25(1), 17–40. https://doi.org/10.1108/JSBED-05-2017-0178/FULL/XML
- Gessler, M. (2017). The lack of collaboration between companies and schools in the German dual apprenticeship system: Historical background and recent data. *International Journal for Research in Vocational Education and Training*, 4(2), 164–195. https://doi.org/10.13152/IJRVET.4.2.4
- Ivanova, I. v. (2017a). Non-formal Education. *Russian Education & Society*, 58(11), 718–731. https://doi.org/10.1080/10609393.2017.1342195
- Ivanova, I. v. (2017b). Non-formal Education. *Russian Education & Society*, 58(11), 718–731. https://doi.org/10.1080/10609393.2017.1342195
- Jaworski, C., Ravichandran, S., Karpinski, A. C., & Singh, S. (2018). The effects of training satisfaction, employee benefits, and incentives on part-time employees' commitment. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 74, 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.IJHM.2018.02.011
- Jørgensen, C. H., Olsen, O. J., & Thunqvist, D. P. (2018). Vocational education in the nordic countries: Learning from diversity. Vocational Education in the Nordic Countries: Learning from Diversity, 1–188. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315414492
- Kadarisman, M. (2011). Tantangan perguruan tinggi dalam era persaingan global. Sociae Polites Edisi Khusus, Novermber.
- Khan, A. A., Bin, S. O., Abbasi, H., Waseem, R. M., Ayaz, M., & Ijaz, M. (2016). Impact of Training and Development of Employees on Employee Performance through Job Satisfaction: A Study of Telecom Sector of Pakistan. *Business Management and Strategy*, 7(1), 29–46. https://doi.org/10.5296/BMS.V7II.9024
- Khasnabis, C., & Motsch, K. H. (2010). *Community-Based Rehabilitation: CBR Guidelines*. World Health Organization.
- Klatt, M., Clarke, K., & Dulfer, N. (2017). Working their way to school completion: a snapshot of School-based Apprenticeships and Traineeships for young Australians. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 69(4), 473–494. https://doi.org/10.1080/13636820.2017.1326161



- Krouglov, A. (2017). Transforming Higher Education in Uzbekistan: From Quality Control to Quality Assurance Culture. *The Rise of Quality Assurance in Asian Higher Education*, 173–189. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-100553-8.00007-0
- Lase, D. (2019). Pendidikan di Era Revolusi Industri 4.0. SUNDERMANN: Jurnal Ilmiah Teologi, Pendidikan, Sains, Humaniora Dan Kebudayaan, 12(2), 28–43. https://doi.org/10.36588/SUNDERMANN.V1I1.18
- L.Stufflebeam, D., & L.S.Coryn, C. (2014). *Evaluation Theory, Models, and Applications* (SecondEdit). Jossey-Bass.
- Mahmudi, I. (2011). CIPP: Suatu Model Evaluasi Program Pendidikan. At-Ta'dib, 6(1). https://doi.org/10.21111/AT-TADIB.V6I1.551
- Marsidi, A., Kasmawati, K., & Bastiana, B. (2020). Evaluation of the Literacy Management Program in the Perspective of CIPP Theory (Context, Input, Process, and Product) in Cluster V Working Group of the Principal of Special Schools in South Sulawesi. International Conference on Science and Advanced Technology (ICSAT), 0(0). https://ojs.unm.ac.id/icsat/article/view/17886
- McGrath, S., Mulder, M., Papier, J., & Suart, R. (2019). Handbook of Vocational Education and Training: Developments in the Changing World of Work. *Springer Nature Switzerland AG*, 1807. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-49789-1_110-1
- Miles, M., Huberman, A., & Saldaña, J. (2014). Sampling: Bounding the collection of data. In *Qualitative Data Analysis: A methods Sourcebook*. SAGE.
- Mueller, B., & Schweri, J. (2015). How specific is apprenticeship training? Evidence from inter-firm and occupational mobility after graduation. *Oxford Economic Papers*, 67(4), 1057–1077. https://doi.org/10.1093/OEP/GPV040
- Pannen, P. (2019). Indonesia online education and quality assurance. *The Higher Education Dialogue on the ASEAN Vision 2025*.
- Safadi, S., & Vlachopoulos, D. (2021). Understanding Faculty Perceptions of Quality Assurance in Saudi Higher Education. *International Journal of Assessment and Evaluation*, 28(1), 79–97. https://doi.org/10.18848/2327-7920/CGP/V28I01/79-97
- Sappa, V., & Aprea, C. (2014). Conceptions of Connectivity: How Swiss Teachers, Trainers and Apprentices Perceive Vocational Learning and Teaching Across Different Learning Sites. *Vocations and Learning*, 7(3), 263–287. https://doi.org/10.1007/S12186-014-9115-Y
- Sappa, V., Aprea, C., & Vogt, B. (2018). Success Factors for Fostering the Connection Between Learning in School and at the Workplace: The Voice of Swiss VET Actors. *Technical and Vocational Education and Training*, 29, 303–325. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-10-8857-5_16
- Sauli, F. (2021). The collaboration between Swiss initial vocational education and training partners: perceptions of apprentices, teachers, and in-company trainers. *Empirical Research in Vocational Education and Training*, 13(1). https://doi.org/10.1186/S40461-021-00114-2
- Secundo, G., Ndou, V., Del Vecchio, P., & De Pascale, G. (2019). Knowledge management in entrepreneurial universities: A structured literature review and avenue for future research agenda. *Management Decision*, 57(12), 3226–3257. https://doi.org/10.1108/MD-11-2018-1266/FULL/HTML
- Sopiansyah, D., & Masruroh, S. (2021). Konsep dan Implementasi Kurikulum MBKM (Merdeka Belajar Kampus Merdeka). *Reslaj : Religion Education Social Laa Roiba Journal*, 4(1), 34–41. https://doi.org/10.47467/RESLAJ.V4I1.458



- Tarazona, C., -Diez, M., & Marhuenda-Fluixá, &. (2022). Apprenticeship in dual and nondual systems between tradition and innovation. *Hungarian Educational Research Journal*, 12(3), 361–366. https://doi.org/10.1556/063.2022.00171
- Tohir, M. (2020). Buku Panduan Merdeka Belajar Kampus Merdeka. https://doi.org/10.31219/OSF.IO/UJMTE
- Vlassopoulos, G., Karikas, G. A., Papageorgiou, E., Psaromiligos, G., Giannouli, N., Karkalousos, P., Vlassopoulos, G., Karikas, G. A., Papageorgiou, E., Psaromiligos, G., Giannouli, N., & Karkalousos, P. (2022). Vocational High Schools Apprenticeship Program, in Greece: Application, Recent Facts and Views. *Open Journal of Leadership*, *11*(1), 92–110. https://doi.org/10.4236/OJL.2022.111007
- Wang, L. (2014). Quality assurance in higher education in China: Control, accountability and freedom. *Policy and Society*, *33*(3), 253–262. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.POLSOC.2014.07.003
- Warju, W. (2016). Educational Program Evaluation using CIPP Model. Innovation of Vocational Technology Education, 12(1). https://doi.org/10.17509/invotec.v12i1.4502
- Wildemeersch, D. (2016). From formal to non-formal: Education, learning and knowledge. *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 48, 115–117. https://www.academia.edu/36618041/From_Formal_to_Non_Formal_Education_Le arning_and_Knowledge