



Fostering Students' Tolerance in Civic Education: An Experimental Study of Value Clarification Technique Assisted by Picture Cards

Made Intan Permani*, Dewa Bagus Sanjaya, I Nengah Suastika

Elementary Education Study Program, Postgraduate Program

Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Indonesia.

*Corresponding Author. Email: intan.permani@student.undiksha.ac.id

Abstract: This study aims to examine the effect of the Value Clarification Technique (VCT) assisted by picture cards on enhancing students' tolerance attitudes in Civic Education. The study employed a quasi-experimental method using a pretest-posttest control group design. The participants consisted of 60 fifth-grade students from a public elementary school in Bali, Indonesia, who were divided into an experimental group and a control group. The experimental group received instruction using the Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards, while the control group received conventional instruction. The instrument used in this study was a 20-item Likert-scale questionnaire designed to measure students' tolerance attitudes. Data were analyzed using descriptive statistics, normality and homogeneity tests, paired-samples t-test, and independent-samples t-test. The results showed that students in the experimental group achieved a higher posttest mean score ($M = 86.43$) compared with those in the control group ($M = 75.87$). The independent-samples t-test revealed a statistically significant difference between the two groups, $t(58) = 3.884$, $p < 0.001$, with a large effect size (Cohen's $d = 1.00$). These findings indicate that the implementation of the Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards had a significant effect on improving students' tolerance attitudes. The integration of reflective learning through the Value Clarification Technique and visual support through picture cards enabled students to understand and internalize tolerance values more meaningfully during classroom interactions.

Article History

Received: 21-04-2026

Revised: 27-05-2026

Accepted: 15-06-2026

Published: 20-07-2026

Key Words:

Tolerance Attitudes;
Value Clarification
Technique; Picture Cards;
Civic Education.

How to Cite: Permani, M. I., Sanjaya, D. B., & Suastika, I. N. (2026). Fostering Students' Tolerance in Civic Education: An Experimental Study of Value Clarification Technique Assisted by Picture Cards . *Jurnal Paedagogy*, 13(3), 1165-1176. <https://doi.org/10.33394/jp.v13i3.20346>



<https://doi.org/10.33394/jp.v13i3.20346>

This is an open-access article under the [CC-BY-SA License](#).



Introduction

Civic Education has a strategic role in helping elementary students develop not only civic knowledge but also civic attitudes that support harmonious social life. At the primary school level, one of the essential attitudes to be cultivated is tolerance, because students begin to interact more intensively with peers who may differ in opinions, habits, social backgrounds, and personal characteristics (Ahsani & Azizah, 2021; Angraini & Ersya, 2025; Anugrah & Rahmat, 2024). In this context, schools are expected to foster respect, empathy, and openness to diversity through meaningful learning experiences rather than through verbal instruction alone (Letasado et al., 2024; Mahlianurrahman et al., 2025; Syudirman et al., 2025). UNESCO places tolerance, respect, and a shared sense of belonging among the important educational aims of citizenship-related learning, which shows that tolerance is not a peripheral outcome but a core educational objective (Trisnayanthi et al., 2024; Werang et al., 2022).

In practice, however, Civic Education in elementary schools is still often dominated by teacher explanation, textbook use, and question-and-answer routines that emphasize



cognitive recall (Ahsani & Azizah, 2021; Alinata et al., 2024; Pastini et al., 2022). Such approaches may help students remember concepts, but they do not always provide sufficient space for learners to reflect on values, make personal judgments, and examine the consequences of their attitudes toward others (Arnyana & Suma, 2025; Eka Swarjawa et al., 2025; Santika, Arnyana, et al., 2022). This is a crucial issue because tolerance is value-laden and situational; it develops when students are guided to respond to real or realistic social situations involving difference, disagreement, and coexistence. Research on civic education has also shown that the quality of teaching matters for students' civic development, indicating that how Civic Education is taught is closely related to what students are likely to understand and internalize (Anugrah & Rahmat, 2024; Rai et al., 2021).

One learning approach that is relevant to this need is the Value Clarification Technique (VCT). VCT emphasizes the process of choosing, appreciating, and acting upon values through reflection and discussion, so it is particularly suitable for topics that involve moral judgment and social attitudes (Anggreni et al., 2025; Widiانا et al., 2022). Rather than asking students merely to accept values as fixed statements, VCT encourages them to consider alternatives, justify their choices, and relate values to concrete situations (Hidayati, 2023; Wiradewi et al., 2020). This reflective nature makes VCT highly compatible with Civic Education, especially when the goal is to strengthen attitudes such as tolerance, respect, and acceptance of difference. Recent evidence also shows that VCT-based materials can foster tolerance and appreciation for diversity more effectively than conventional approaches centered on rote learning (Jannah et al., 2025; Nurizka, 2021).

The use of picture cards can further strengthen the implementation of VCT in elementary classrooms. For younger learners, visual stimuli are important because they make social situations more concrete, accessible, and discussable. Picture cards can present short scenes of cooperation, disagreement, exclusion, helping behavior, or respectful interaction, allowing students to respond to realistic contexts before clarifying the values involved (Istyasiwi et al., 2021; Luruk et al., 2024; Sugitra et al., 2022). Studies on picture-supported learning suggest that pictures can facilitate children's understanding by helping them connect verbal information with visual representations, while picture-enriched instruction has been shown to support stronger learning than text-only presentation (Hardiansyah, 2022; Landina & Agustiana, 2022; Yabashiru et al., 2025). For elementary students, this visual support is particularly valuable because it reduces abstraction and helps them interpret values through observable situations (Arisandhi et al., 2023; Premana et al., 2023; Septiana et al., 2022).

Several previous studies have highlighted the educational relevance of value-oriented and media-supported instruction. Research on VCT has reported positive contributions to multicultural understanding and tolerance, while broader scholarship in civic and character education has emphasized that value internalization is more effective when students are actively engaged in reflection and contextual interpretation (Jannah et al., 2025; Nurizka, 2021; Widiانا et al., 2022). Other studies on visual and picture-based instructional supports have shown that images can improve comprehension and participation among young learners by making learning materials more meaningful and memorable. Even so, empirical studies that specifically investigate students' tolerance attitudes in Civic Education through VCT assisted by picture cards at the elementary school level are still limited. Existing studies tend to focus either on VCT in broader value education settings or on picture-based media for other learning outcomes, leaving a gap in research that combines both within a quasi-experimental Civic Education design.



The novelty of this study lies in the integration of Value Clarification Technique and picture cards as a unified instructional strategy to enhance students' tolerance attitudes in elementary Civic Education. Unlike previous studies that examined VCT or visual media separately, this study uses picture cards as value-laden prompts and VCT as a reflective process to guide students in choosing, justifying, and internalizing tolerant attitudes through a quasi-experimental design. The Balinese sociocultural context makes tolerance education particularly important because students live in a plural environment shaped by differences in religion, ethnicity, tradition, language, and community practices. Therefore, elementary Civic Education in Bali needs to provide meaningful learning experiences that help students respect differences, build empathy, and practice harmonious interaction in their daily social life. Accordingly, the purpose of this study is to examine the effectiveness of Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards in enhancing elementary students' tolerance attitudes in Civic Education.

Research Method

This study employed a quasi-experimental method using a pretest–posttest control group design. This design was selected because the study aimed to examine the effectiveness of Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards in enhancing students' tolerance attitudes in Civic Education by comparing the attitude changes of students in the experimental and control groups before and after the treatment. Through this design, the researcher was able to identify whether the instructional treatment contributed to a meaningful improvement in students' tolerance attitudes.

The study was conducted at a public elementary school in Bali, Indonesia. The participants were fifth-grade students in the 2025/2026 academic year. Two intact classes were involved in the study, with a total of 60 students. The experimental class consisted of 30 students, while the control class consisted of 30 students. The sample was selected using cluster sampling because the researcher used existing classroom groupings without randomly rearranging students into new classes. One class was assigned as the experimental group and received instruction through Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards, while the other class was assigned as the control group and received conventional teaching in Civic Education.

The instrument used in this study was a tolerance attitude questionnaire developed based on indicators of tolerance relevant to elementary Civic Education. The questionnaire was designed to measure students' attitudes toward respecting differences, appreciating classmates' opinions, cooperating with peers from different backgrounds, avoiding discriminatory behavior, and showing empathy and mutual respect in classroom interaction (Dwintari & Murdiono, 2023; Ziemes, 2024). The instrument consisted of 20 statement items using a five-point Likert scale, ranging from strongly disagree (1) to strongly agree (5). Negative statements were scored in reverse. The total score of each student reflected the level of tolerance attitude, with higher scores indicating stronger tolerance attitudes.

Before being administered in the actual study, the questionnaire was reviewed and adjusted to suit the language level and comprehension ability of fifth-grade elementary students. The pretest was given to both groups before the treatment to identify the students' initial tolerance attitudes. After that, the experimental group was taught using Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards, while the control group learned through conventional instruction. The treatment was conducted in four meetings, and each meeting focused on themes related to tolerance in everyday school life, such as respecting differences



in opinions, accepting diverse classmates, cooperating in group work, resolving conflicts peacefully, and appreciating social diversity in the classroom environment.

In the experimental class, the learning process followed the stages of Value Clarification Technique. Students were first presented with picture cards showing social situations related to tolerance and diversity. They were then encouraged to observe the situations, express their opinions, choose attitudes they considered appropriate, explain the reasons for their choices, and reflect on the values represented in each situation. Through this process, students were expected to clarify their values and develop deeper awareness of tolerant behavior. Meanwhile, the control class studied the same topics through teacher explanation, textbook use, and regular question-and-answer activities without the structured use of VCT and picture cards.

The procedure of the study consisted of four stages. First, the researcher prepared lesson plans, picture cards, and the tolerance attitude questionnaire. Second, both groups were administered the pretest. Third, the treatment was implemented in the experimental group, while the control group received conventional instruction. Fourth, the posttest was administered to both groups to determine changes in students' tolerance attitudes after the intervention.

The data were analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics with SPSS version 26. Descriptive statistics were used to calculate mean and gain scores, while assumption tests included the Shapiro-Wilk test for normality and Levene's Test for homogeneity. After the assumptions were met, paired samples t-test was used to examine score improvement within each group, and independent samples t-test was used to compare posttest scores between the experimental and control groups. All tests were conducted at a significance level of 0.05.

Results and Discussion

The results of this study were obtained from the pretest and posttest scores of students' tolerance attitudes in both the experimental and control groups. The pretest was administered before the treatment to identify students' initial tolerance attitudes, while the posttest was conducted after the implementation of Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards in Civic Education.

Table 1. Descriptive Statistics of Pretest and Posttest Scores of Tolerance Attitudes

Group	N	Pretest Mean	Posttest Mean	Gain Score
Experimental Group	30	68.27	86.43	18.16
Control Group	30	67.50	75.87	8.37

Based on Table 1, the pretest mean scores of the experimental group ($M = 68.27$) and the control group ($M = 67.50$) were relatively similar, indicating that both groups had comparable initial tolerance attitudes before the treatment. After the intervention, both groups showed improvement; however, the experimental group achieved a higher posttest mean score ($M = 86.43$) and gain score (18.16) than the control group ($M = 75.87$; gain score = 8.37). This greater improvement suggests that Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards provided a more meaningful learning experience than conventional instruction. Through picture cards, students were able to observe concrete social situations related to tolerance, while VCT guided them to choose appropriate attitudes, explain their reasons, and reflect on the values involved. This reflective and visual learning process likely helped students internalize tolerance more deeply than teacher-centered explanation and regular question-and-answer activities used in the control group. To examine the improvement within each group, a paired samples t-test was conducted. The results are shown in Table 2.

**Table 2. Paired Samples t-Test Results**

Group	Mean Difference	t-value	Sig. (2-tailed)	Decision
Experimental Group	18.16	8.932	0.000	Significant
Control Group	8.37	4.285	0.000	Significant

Table 2 shows that both groups experienced significant improvement from pretest to posttest because the significance values were below 0.05. Nevertheless, the experimental group showed a higher mean difference and t-value than the control group, indicating that the treatment produced a stronger improvement in students' tolerance attitudes. To test the main hypothesis of the study, an independent samples t-test was conducted on the posttest scores of the two groups. The result is presented in Table 3.

Table 3. Independent Samples t-Test Result on Posttest Scores

Variable	Mean Experimental	Mean Control	t-value	Sig. (2-tailed)	Decision
Posttest Scores	86.43	75.87	3.884	0.000	Significant Difference

Based on Table 3, the significance value was 0.000, which is lower than 0.05. This indicates that there was a statistically significant difference between the posttest scores of the experimental group and the control group. The students who learned through Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards achieved higher tolerance attitude scores than those who learned through conventional instruction. Overall, the results indicate that the implementation of Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards was more effective in enhancing students' tolerance attitudes in Civic Education than conventional teaching. The students in the experimental group not only obtained higher posttest scores but also demonstrated greater improvement in their tolerance attitudes after the treatment.

Discussion

The improvement in students' tolerance attitudes can be understood primarily as the result of a learning process that moved values from the level of abstract instruction to the level of personal reflection and situational judgment (Astuti et al., 2023; Hikmawati et al., 2024; Suma et al., 2020). In Civic Education, tolerance is not merely a concept to be remembered, but a disposition that must be interpreted, considered, and practiced in relation to others. For that reason, an approach such as Value Clarification Technique is pedagogically relevant because it asks students to choose, justify, and reflect on values instead of passively receiving moral statements from the teacher (Hidayati, 2023; Puspita et al., 2020; Widiana et al., 2022). Recent research on VCT-based instructional materials likewise shows that this approach can foster tolerance and appreciation for diversity more effectively than conventional, memorization-oriented teaching (Anggreni et al., 2025; Jannah et al., 2025).

A key strength of VCT in this study lies in its reflective structure. When students are invited to respond to social situations, consider alternatives, and explain why a certain attitude is appropriate, they are not only learning what tolerance means but also developing a basis for moral reasoning (Ermawati et al., 2021; Pastini et al., 2022; Suastika, 2022). This matters in elementary Civic Education because attitudes such as respect, acceptance, empathy, and openness to difference cannot be formed optimally through one-way explanation alone. They require students to engage in value judgment. In this sense, the contribution of VCT is not simply methodological variation; it supports the deeper internalization of civic values by making students active interpreters of meaning (Puspita et al., 2020; Wiradewi et al., 2020). That interpretation is consistent with broader scholarship



showing that the quality of civic teaching influences learners' civic orientations and willingness to participate in social life.

The use of picture cards appears to strengthen that process by making value-laden situations concrete and accessible to elementary learners. At the primary school level, students generally understand social values more easily when they are attached to visible actions, familiar contexts, and recognizable interactions (Luruk et al., 2024; Sugitra et al., 2022). Picture cards functioned as visual prompts that transformed tolerance from an abstract moral term into something students could observe and discuss, such as listening to a different opinion, accepting a classmate's background, or cooperating despite disagreement (Betliani et al., 2025; Rosidah et al., 2022). Evidence from picture-supported instruction shows that visual representations can help learners connect verbal information with concrete meaning and improve understanding by reducing abstraction. In the present context, picture cards likely made the clarification of values more focused and developmentally appropriate (Inayah et al., 2024; Juita et al., 2025; Ramadhani et al., 2023).

Another important point is that the combination of VCT and picture cards likely worked because it joined cognitive and affective engagement in the same lesson (Juniati et al., 2023; Zikrilla & Amini, 2024). Students were not only exposed to classroom content, but were also placed in a position where they had to interpret a situation, imagine its interpersonal consequences, and consider which response reflected tolerance (Atiaturrahmaniah et al., 2022; Santika, Suastra, et al., 2022; Wardani et al., 2023). This kind of learning is especially important in Civic Education because tolerance attitudes are shaped not only by knowledge of social norms, but also by the ability to recognize others' perspectives in concrete situations (Gading et al., 2025; Pratama & Gading, 2024; Raditya et al., 2023). Studies on elementary citizenship and classroom life suggest that children's citizenship is visible in everyday peer relations and social behavior, which means that effective civic learning should connect instruction with lived interaction rather than remain purely declarative (Pitriani & Dantes, 2024; Putri et al., 2025; Wijayanti et al., 2025).

The findings also reinforce the argument that tolerance education is more effective when it is contextualized. In many classrooms, tolerance is presented as a general moral message, but students may not fully grasp its practical implications unless they see how it operates in everyday school life (Antara et al., 2022; Parmiti et al., 2022; Widiana et al., 2022). Through picture cards and clarification activities, tolerance becomes linked to real classroom experiences such as respecting different opinions, avoiding exclusion, and working with peers from different backgrounds (Anfal et al., 2024; Susiani et al., 2022; Wahyu et al., 2020). This is pedagogically significant because value education becomes stronger when students recognize the relevance of a value to situations they may actually face (Sanjaya et al., 2021; Suastika, 2022). Research on multicultural values teaching in elementary Civic Education similarly shows that value-based learning becomes more meaningful when it is embedded in concrete educational practice rather than treated as a purely theoretical topic (Margunayasa et al., 2019; Pramana et al., 2024).

From a curricular standpoint, the study suggests that Civic Education should not be reduced to the transmission of civic concepts, rules, or moral slogans. The broader aim of the subject is to shape civic dispositions that support coexistence in diverse social settings. Tolerance is one of those dispositions, and its development requires pedagogical strategies that make students think, feel, and respond. The present study therefore supports a more interactive view of Civic Education, one in which the teacher facilitates value exploration rather than merely delivering normative content. This interpretation is aligned with studies



showing that learning management and teaching quality in civic education influence how effectively civic dispositions are developed.

Theoretically, this study contributes by linking value clarification pedagogy with visual support media in the specific domain of tolerance attitudes. Previous work has often examined VCT in broader character or multicultural education settings, or discussed visual media in relation to comprehension and participation. This study adds to that body of work by showing how a reflective value-based technique and simple visual prompts can operate together in Civic Education for elementary students. Its contribution is therefore not merely technical but conceptual: tolerance attitudes may be strengthened more effectively when civic learning is designed as a process of guided reflection on visible social situations. That contribution is relevant in plural educational contexts where schools are expected to cultivate respectful social behavior from an early stage.

Even so, the pedagogical implications should be interpreted carefully. The success of VCT assisted by picture cards does not mean that media or method alone automatically produces tolerance. The quality of teacher facilitation remains central. Students need opportunities to speak, justify, compare viewpoints, and reflect without fear of being judged. In other words, the method is effective not simply because picture cards are visually appealing, but because they become tools for structured reflection within a supportive classroom interaction. The implication is that Civic Education teachers should use picture cards not as decorative teaching aids, but as triggers for dialogue, reflection, and value formation.

Overall, this discussion indicates that the stronger tolerance attitudes found in the experimental learning process are pedagogically reasonable. Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards appears to work because it translates tolerance into observable situations, invites students to reason about values, and places civic learning within the social reality of the classroom. In that sense, the study supports the view that tolerance in Civic Education is best developed through reflective, contextual, and student-centered instruction rather than through explanation alone.

Conclusion

This study concludes that Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards can enhance students' tolerance attitudes in Civic Education. The learning process became more meaningful because students were not only introduced to tolerance as a moral concept, but were also guided to observe social situations, reflect on values, express judgments, and relate those values to everyday classroom life. Through this process, tolerance was understood as a practical attitude that should be demonstrated in interaction with others. The study also indicates that the combination of reflective learning and visual support is pedagogically effective for elementary students. Value Clarification Technique provided opportunities for students to clarify and internalize values, while picture cards helped make tolerance-related situations more concrete and easier to interpret. Therefore, this instructional approach can be considered an effective alternative for strengthening tolerance attitudes in elementary Civic Education, especially in learning contexts that require the development of civic values and social awareness.

Recommendation

Future research is recommended to involve a larger number of participants and a wider range of school settings so that the findings can be generalized more broadly across



different elementary education contexts. Further studies may also examine the long-term influence of Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards on other civic outcomes, such as empathy, respect for diversity, social responsibility, or democratic attitudes. Future research is recommended to involve more participants and diverse school settings to strengthen the generalizability of the findings. Further studies may also examine the long-term effect of Value Clarification Technique assisted by picture cards on other civic attitudes, such as empathy, respect for diversity, social responsibility, and democratic behavior. For practice and policy, schools and education stakeholders are encouraged to develop teacher guidebooks and conduct specific training for elementary Civic Education teachers on the syntax, learning scenarios, picture card design, discussion techniques, and assessment of VCT assisted by visual media.

References

- Ahsani, E. luthfi F., & Azizah, N. R. (2021). Implementasi Literasi Budaya Dan Kewargaan Untuk Mengembangkan Keterampilan Sosial Siswa Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Di Tengah Pandemi. *Jurnal Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan*, 11(01), 7. <https://doi.org/10.20527/kewarganegaraan.v11i01.10317>
- Alinata, R., Susanti, E., Sari, W. A., Dinillah, S., Nurfadilah, & Sofi, D. N. (2024). Membangun kecakapan kewarganegaraan digital melalui implementasi PKn di era revolusi industri 4.0. *Jurnal Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Dan Politik*. <https://doi.org/10.61476/d0n6cg11>
- Anfal, W., Suarni, N. K., & Margunayasa, I. G. (2024). Identifikasi Motivasi Belajar Siswa Sekolah Dasar (SD/MI) Di Era Merdeka Belajar. *Indonesian Journal of Education and Learning*, 7(2).
- Anggreni, S., Ananda, A., & Khaidir, A. (2025). DEVELOPING A VALUE CLARIFICATION TECHNIQUE-SHORT VIDEO PROJECT (VCT-SVP) LEARNING MODEL FOR CULTIVATING THE CHARACTER VALUE OF PATRIOTISM IN PANCASILA EDUCATION COURSE AT THE HIGHER EDUCATION. *Lex Localis: Journal of Local Self-Government*, 23(11).
- Angraini, R., & Ersya, M. P. (2025). Peran Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan dalam Memperkuat Digital Right dan Tanggung Jawab Warga Negara. *Journal of Civic Education*. <https://doi.org/10.24036/jce.v7i4.1130>
- Antara, I. G. W. S., Suma, K., & Parmiti, D. P. (2022). Scrapbook Digital: Konstruksi Media Pembelajaran Bermuatan Soal-Soal Higher Order Thinking Skills. *Jurnal Edutech Undiksha*, 10(1), 11–20.
- Anugrah, A., & Rahmat, R. (2024). Pendidikan Karakter dalam Perspektif Kurikulum Pendidikan Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan (PPKn). *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran Indonesia (JPPI)*, 4(1), 22–34. <https://doi.org/10.53299/jppi.v4i1.403>
- Arisandhi, G. A. M. M., Wibawa, I. M. C., & Yudiana, K. (2023). Flipbook: Media Pembelajaran Interaktif Untuk Meningkatkan Kognitif IPA Siswa Sekolah Dasar. *Mimbar PGSD Undiksha*, 11(1), 165–174.
- Arnyana, I. B. P., & Suma, I. K. (2025). Pengembangan Model Pendidikan Karakter Melalui Fullday School Khas Lombok Barat Pada Siswa Sekolah Dasar. *PENDASI Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Indonesia*, 9(1), 166–180.
- Astuti, C. F., Suma, I. K., & Suastra, I. W. (2023). Cerita Bergambar Berbasis Pop Up Solusi Untuk Meningkatkan Keterampilan Membaca Cepat Pada Kelas Tinggi Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Review Pendidikan Dan Pengajaran (JRPP)*, 6(2), 42–49.



<https://doi.org/10.31004/jrpp.v6i2.17419>

- Atiaturrahmaniah, A., Arnyana, I. B. P., & Suastra, I. W. (2022). Peran model science, technology, engineering, arts, and math (STEAM) dalam meningkatkan berpikir kritis dan literasi sains siswa sekolah dasar. *JPGI (Jurnal Penelitian Guru Indonesia)*, 7(4), 368–375. <http://dx.doi.org/10.29210/022537jpgi0005>
- Betliani, K. M., Saputri, N. M. A., Swarjawa, I. W. E., Yantika, I. W. A., Putrayasa, I. B., & Sudiana, I. N. (2025). Analisis Metode Pembelajaran Membaca dan Menulis Permulaan di Sekolah Dasar. *Widya Accarya*, 16(2), 153–160.
- Dwintari, J. W., & Murdiono, M. (2023). The strategy of integrating tolerance values into civics learning in inclusive school. *Jurnal Civics: Media Kajian Kewarganegaraan*, 20(2), 214–222. <https://doi.org/10.21831/jc.v20i2.42158>
- Eka Swarjawa, I. W., Arnyana, I. B., & Suja, I. W. (2025). Analisis Pengaruh Implementasi Nilai-Nilai Tri Hita Karana Oleh Kepala Sekolah terhadap Kualitas Hubungan Antarwarga Sekolah. *Journal of Comprehensive Science (JCS)*, 4(1). <https://doi.org/10.59188/jcs.v4i1.2983>
- Ermawati, E., Sofiarini, A., & Valen, A. (2021). Penerapan Model Value Clarifications Technique (VCT) pada Pembelajaran PKn di Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 5(5), 3541–3550.
- Gading, I. K., Sudarma, I. K., Lestari, L. P. S., Rismawan, K. S. G., Putri, D. A. W. M., Dewi, D. A., & Lyesmaya, D. (2025). Developing a Technology-Enhanced Digital Counseling Model to Improve Students' Learning Comfort and Happiness. *Journal of Educational Technology and Learning Creativity*, 3(2), 435–450. <https://doi.org/10.37251/jetlc.v3i2.2538>
- Hardiansyah, F. (2022). Improve science learning outcomes for elementary school students through the development of flipbook media. *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan IPA*, 8(6), 3069–3077.
- Hidayati, B. N. (2023). The Value Clarification Technique Learning Model Improves the Character of Elementary School Students. *International Journal of Elementary Education*, 7(2), 319–327.
- Hikmawati, H., Suastra, I. W., Suma, K., & Sudiarmika, A. (2024). Online lectures with local wisdom context: Efforts to develop students' higher-order thinking skills. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education (IJERE)*, 13(2), 943.
- Inayah, N., Aeni, A. N., & Hanifah, N. (2024). Pengembangan Media E-Flipbook Materi Keragaman Sosial Budaya terhadap Sikap Toleransi Peserta Didik Kelas IV. *ISLAMIKA*. <https://doi.org/10.36088/islamika.v6i4.5287>
- Istyasiwi, M. E., Auliaty, Y., & Sholeh, D. A. (2021). Pengembangan Media Digital Kartu Domino Rantai Makanan (Dorama) Pada Pembelajaran Ipa Di Sekolah Dasar. *Prima Magistra: Jurnal Ilmiah Kependidikan*, 2(2), 254–263. <https://doi.org/10.37478/jpm.v2i2.1115>
- Jannah, M., Irawan, A., & Hidayat, A. G. (2025). Enhancing Fifth Grade Students' Character Values through the Value Clarification Technique (VCT) in Civic Education Learning. *Lectura: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 16(2), 681–695.
- Juita, H., Widiyanto, S., Yeffa, N., Apriliyani, A., Megayanti, W., Ati, A. P., & Sumadyo, B. (2025). Literature Learning to Instill Local Culture Using Digital Flipbooks for Elementary School Students. *Journal of Innovation in Educational and Cultural Research*. <https://doi.org/10.46843/jiecr.v6i2.1583>
- Juniati, G., Putrayasa, I. B., & Margunayasa, I. G. (2023). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Digital



- Berorientasi Wana Kerthi Loka Bali pada Pembelajaran IPAS Kelas IV Sekolah Dasar. *PENDASI Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Indonesia*, 7(1), 94–106. https://doi.org/10.23887/jurnal_pendas.v7i1.2018
- Landina, I., & Agustiana, I. (2022). Meningkatkan Berpikir Kritis Siswa melalui Media Pembelajaran Flipbook berbasis Kasus pada Muatan IPA Kelas V SD. *Mimbar Ilmu*, 27(3), 443–452. <https://doi.org/10.23887/mi.v27i3.52555>
- Letasado, M., Muhsam, J., & Lasmawan, I. (2024). Enhancing Social Studies Outcomes Through Experiential Learning and Social-Emotional Development Using Poster Media in Fifth-Grade Classrooms. *AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan*. <https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v16i4.5670>
- Luruk, A., Letasado, M. R., & Ahmad, R. A. R. (2024). Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Peserta Didik Melalui Model Pembelajaran Process Oriented Guided Inquiry Learning (Pogil) Berbantuan Media Gambar Kartun Mata Pelajaran IPAS Topik C Indonesiaku Kaya Alamnya Kelas V SD Inpres Oepoi Kupang. *Mimbar PGSD Flobamorata*, 2(1), 79–84. <https://doi.org/10.51494/mpf.v2i1.1741>
- Mahlianurrahman, Lasmawan, I. W., Candiasa, I. M., & Suastra, I. W. (2025). Teachers' Challenges in Improving Students' Collaboration Abilities. *Entita: Jurnal Pendidikan Ilmu Pengetahuan Sosial Dan Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*, 1, 15–26. <https://doi.org/10.19105/ejpis.v1i.19123>
- Margunayasa, I. G., Dantes, N., Marhaeni, A., & Suastra, I. W. (2019). The Effect of Guided Inquiry Learning and Cognitive Style on Science Learning Achievement. *International Journal of Instruction*, 12(1), 737–750.
- Nurizka, R. (2021). Meta-analisis quasi eksperimental model pembelajaran value clarification technique (VCT) terhadap prestasi belajar siswa sekolah dasar. *Jurnal BASICEDU: Journal of Elementary Education*, 5(2), 446–454.
- Parmiti, D. P., Antara, I. G. W. S., & Wulandari, I. G. A. A. M. (2022). The effectiveness of E-Scrapbook media containing HOTS questions on science learning outcomes of elementary school students. *Journal of Education Research and Evaluation*, 6(3), 484–491.
- Pastini, N. W., Jampel, I. N., & Widiartini, N. K. (2022). Pengaruh Implementasi Model Pembelajaran Learning Cycle 7e Terhadap Hasil Belajar Pendidikan Pancasila Dan Kewarganegaraan (PPKn) dengan pengendalian Motivasi Belajar. *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Evaluasi Pendidikan Indonesia*, 12(1), 14–24. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jpepi.v12i1.854>
- Pitriani, N. W., & Dantes, N. (2024). Game Based Learning Berorientasi Kahoot! Meningkatkan Motivasi Belajar Siswa Kelas V Sekolah Dasar. *Didaktika: Jurnal Kependidikan*, 13(1), 643–650.
- Pramana, P. M. A., Suarni, N. K., & Margunayasa, I. G. (2024). Relevansi Teori Belajar Konstruktivisme dengan Model Inkuiri Terbimbing terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa. *Ideguru: Jurnal Karya Ilmiah Guru*, 9(2), 487–493. <https://doi.org/10.51169/ideguru.v9i2.875>
- Pratama, G. P., & Gading, I. K. (2024). Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif Tipe STAD Berbantuan Video Pembelajaran terhadap Hasil Belajar IPA Siswa. *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pengembangan Sains Dan Humaniora*, 8(2), 214–223.
- Premana, D. N. D., Widiana, I. W., & Wibawa, I. M. C. (2023). Improving Conceptual Knowledge in Elementary School Students with Revised Bloom's Taxonomy-Oriented Learning Activities. *Thinking Skills and Creativity Journal*, 6(1), 9–18.



- Puspita, R. D., Apriliana, A. C., & Nugraha, C. Y. (2020). Analysis of Value Clarification Technique Learning Model Through Pilot Methods in Learning to Improve Affective Intelligence. *3rd International Conference on Language, Literature, Culture, and Education (ICOLLITE 2019)*, 319–323.
- Putri, I. A. P. R. W., Humairah, N., Rasna, I. W., Putrayasa, I. B., & Suandi, I. N. (2025). Mendidik Generasi Z Dan A: Strategi Pembelajaran Bahasa yang Efektif: Educating Generation Z and A: Effective Language Learning Strategies. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra Indonesia Undiksha*, 15(2), 274–282.
- Raditya, K. A., Gading, I. K., & Agustiana, I. G. A. T. (2023). Model pembelajaran kooperatif tipe jigsaw berbantuan media PowerPoint untuk meningkatkan kemampuan kolaborasi dan hasil belajar IPA siswa kelas V sekolah dasar. *Jurnal Media Dan Teknologi Pendidikan*, 3(2), 84–93.
- Rai, I. B., Suwendi, I. M., & Mahendra, P. R. A. (2021). Implementasi Tri Hita Karana Dalam Pengelolaan Pendidikan di SMP Dwijendra Denpasar. *Jurnal Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Undiksha*, 9(2), 431–439. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jpku.v9i2.34145>
- Ramadhani, D., Nurhasanah, A., & Fadillah, M. A. (2023). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Berbasis Digital Menggunakan Aplikasi Heyzine Flipbooks Tentang Kesultanan Banten Abad Ke-17 Di Kelas X Smkn 2 Kota Serang. *Jurnal Inovasi Pembelajaran Di Sekolah*, 4(2), 388–402.
- Rosidah, C. T., Putrayasa, I. B., Wesnawa, I. G. A., & Candiasa, I. M. (2022). Thematic comic to cultivate eco-literacy for young learners. *Kasetsart Journal of Social Sciences*, 43(3), 735–740.
- Sanjaya, D. B., Suartama, I. K., Suastika, I. N., & Dewantara, I. (2021). The Implementation of Balinese Follore-Based Civic Education for Strengthening Character Education. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences*, 16(1), 303–316.
- Santika, I. G. N., Arnyana, I. B. P., Suastra, I. W., & Kartika, I. M. (2022). Contents Standard Policy of Basic Education in The National Level Reviewed from The Scope of Citizenship Education Materials. *Journal of Sustainable Development Science*, 4(1), 29–36.
- Santika, I. G. N., Suastra, I. W., & Arnyana, I. B. P. (2022). Membentuk karakter peduli lingkungan pada siswa sekolah dasar melalui pembelajaran ipa. *Jurnal Education and Development*, 10(1), 207–212.
- Septiana, I. G. Y., Wibawa, I. M. C., & Trisna, G. A. P. S. (2022). Interactive multimedia based on articulate storylines in the topic of plant anatomy and physiology. *International Journal of Elementary Education*, 6(2), 182–194.
- Suastika, I. N. (2022). Model Pendidikan Profesi Guru Berasrama (Memperkuat Karakter Dan Profesionalisme Guru Era Revolusi Industri). *Jurnal Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Undiksha*, 10(3), 34–44.
- Sugitra, K., Wiarta, I. W., & Ganing, N. N. (2022). Media Pembelajaran Kartun Animasi 2D Berorientasi Kontekstual Learning pada Mata Pelajaran Matematika. *Journal for Lesson and Learning Studies*, 5(1), 96–105. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jlls.v5i1.45491>
- Suma, K., Mudana, I. W., & Pujani, N. M. (2020). Pengembangan Perangkat Pembelajaran Terintegrasi Pendidikan Karakter Berbasis Tri Hita Karana di Sekolah Dasar Negeri 1 Baktiseraga. *Proceeding Senadimas Undiksha*, 1056.
- Susiani, K., Suartama, I. K., Adnyana, K. S., Dantes, N., Arnyana, I. B. P., Suarni, N. K., & Suranata, K. (2022). Identification of the Characteristics of Elementary School



- Scientific Literacy. *Res Militaris*, 12(2), 7541–7547.
- Syudirman, Suastra, I. W., & Lasmawan, I. W. (2025). EVOLUSI KURIKULUM SEKOLAH DASAR DI INDONESIA DARI MASA KE MASA. *Global Education Trends*, 3(1). <https://doi.org/10.61798/get.v3i1.345>
- Trisnayanthi, K. E., Jampel, I. N., & Rati, N. W. (2024). Model Pembelajaran Collaborative Creativity (CC) Berbantuan E-LKPD Terhadap Hasil Belajar IPAS Kelas V Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pengembangan Sains Dan Humaniora*, 8(2), 114–123.
- Wahyu, Y., Suastra, I. W., Sadia, I. W., & Suarni, N. K. (2020). The Effectiveness of Mobile Augmented Reality Assisted Stem-Based Learning on Scientific Literacy and Students' Achievement. *International Journal of Instruction*, 13(3), 343–356.
- Wardani, I. U., Lasmawan, I. W., & Suastra, I. W. (2023). Guru dan tantangan kurikulum baru: Analisis peran guru dalam kebijakan kurikulum baru. *Jurnal Darma Agung*, 31(5), 301–313.
- Werang, B. R., Jampel, I. N., Agung, A. A. G., Putri, H. W. S., & Asaloei, S. I. (2022). Teacher teaching performance, students' learning motivation and academic achievement. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences*, 17(12), 4672–4682. <https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v17i12.7586>
- Widiana, I. W., Kertih, I. W., Kristiantari, M. G. R., Parmiti, D. P., & Adijaya, M. A. (2022). The Effect of Project Based Assessment with Value Clarification Technique in Improving Students' Civics Learning Outcomes by Controlling the Family Environment. *European Journal of Educational Research*, 11(4), 1969–1979.
- Wijayanti, N. K. A., Putrayasa, I. B., & Sanjaya, D. B. (2025). Media Interaktif Berbasis Cerita Bergambar untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Membaca Pemahaman Siswa Kelas V SD. *Journal of Education Action Research*, 9(4), 703–714.
- Wiradewi, N. M., Asri, I. G. A. A. S., & Manuaba, I. B. S. (2020). Value clarification technique learning model based on folklore towards knowledge competence of civic education. *Jurnal Ilmiah Sekolah Dasar*, 4(3), 505–514.
- Yabashiru, F., Musfiza, L., & Nurhaliza, S. (2025). The effectiveness of using flipbook learning media improving student learning outcomes in elementary school: A literature review. *Jurnal Perkembangan Ilmiah Multidisiplin*, 1(1), 23–31.
- Ziemes, J. F. (2024). Measuring and explaining political tolerance among adolescents: insights from the International Civic and Citizenship Education Study 2016. *Large-Scale Assessments in Education*, 12(1), 17. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1186/s40536-024-00206-x>
- Zikrilla, P., & Amini, R. (2024). PENGEMBANGAN MEDIA PEMBELAJARAN IPAS MENGGUNAKAN KAHOOT! BERBASIS RADEC BERBANTUAN MINDMAP DI KELAS V SEKOLAH DASAR. *Pendas: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dasar*, 9(2), 1957–1971. <https://doi.org/10.23969/jp.v9i2.13575>