THE IMPACT OF DISREGARDING FORMULAIC COMPETENCE IN DEVELOPING SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL ENGLISH TEXTBOOKS IN INDONESIA

Silvester Goridus Sukur

English Lecturer, Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa University, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Corresponding Author Email: silvester_gs@yahoo.com

Article Info

Abstract

This research aims to uncover the impact of disregarding the formulaic competence in designing electronic English textbooks for SMA students in Indonesia. This research belongs to qualitative content analysis one, conducted by using content analysis research method in Indonesia from 2018 to 2019. NVivo 12 Plus was applied to manage and analyze the data that had been stored in this qualitative research software. The data were obtained from three SMA English textbooks for SMA students nationwide as the data sources. The aforementioned textbooks are Bahasa Inggris X by Widiati, U. et al., Bahasa Inggris XI by Bashir, M.; and Bahasa Inggris XII by Widiati, U. et al., all of which were issued by the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture in 2017 and 2018 respectively. One of the techniques applied to achieve the trustworthiness of this study was by using Kappa statistic reliability test in NVivo 12 Plus, the result of which gained the value of reliability agreement level of data > 0.75, which means that it was in excellent category. The research result demonstrated that the three chosen SMA English textbooks lacked the topics for the students to promote their formulaic competence. The impact of this point made the students unable to learn such formulaic-competence-related materials. This case would make them find it hard to improve their communicative competence and reading comprehension skill. Therefore, it is suggested that, for the future revised edition, the writers of the textbooks for SMA students all around Indonesia develop the content of the textbooks comprehensively including the materials for formulaic competence.

Keywords

Textbook; Formulaic competence; Communicative competence;

How to cite: Sukur, S. G. (2020). The impact of disregarding formulaic competence in developing senior high school English textbooks in Indonesia. JOLLT Journal of Languages and Language Teaching, 8(2), 183-192

DOI: https://doi.org/10.33394/jollt.v8i2.2521

INTRODUCTION

Formulaic competence as one of the competences contained in communicative competence that students are expected to have is crucial. The formulaic competence is considered so important for students’ vocabulary development that such a kind of competence should have been provided in the textbooks designed and developed to be used by all SMA (Senior High Schools) students all over Indonesia. The fact is, however, based on the preliminary research the materials for the aforementioned competence were not contained much in the textbooks. The negative effect was that SMA English teachers could not depend on all the three textbooks, but looked for more relevant sources to cover up the deficiencies of the books. The further impact of this type of disregarding the formulaic expressions in the textbooks was that the communicative competence as stated in 2013 Curriculum was difficult to achieve.

Formulaic expressions include fixed expressions and collocations. These two language components are important because they can promote learners’ English competence not only in reading comprehension but also in speaking skill. Regarding with this case, Liu (2014) argues
that formulaic expressions play a vital role in people’s daily communication. It is undeniable that people can communicate by using grammatically-acceptable English, but it is also factual that people can use ready-created expressions automatically. A similar notion is proposed by (Quassdorf, 2010) that in daily communication people not only use expressions which are grammatically acceptable but also use fixed or ready-made expressions.

These ideas demonstrate that when SMA students are required to learn English as stipulated by a prevailing curriculum, the English textbooks that they are using should prepare such ready-made language items. The purpose is that they will not only be able to use expressions which are grammatically acceptable but also use expressions which are prefabricated. The negligence of these types of content of such books hinders learners’ English competence improvement in terms of formulaic expressions as part of the effort to promote their English communicative competence.

The SMA English textbooks to be used in Indonesia nationwide, therefore, needs to design and provide the content related to these formulaic language components. This is important because in order to be competent in communicative English, students need not only to learn sentences in accordance grammatical rules but also to master the ready-made expressions, which in this context refer to formulaic language aspects namely collocations and fixed chunks. To ensure that these types of materials for SMA English textbooks in Indonesia have been developed, this research was done to uncover to what extent have the SMA English textbooks contained the aforesaid materials.

Researchers, so far, has paid less attention to conducting studies dealing with formulaic competence in SMA English textbooks in Indonesia. The impact was that the materials connected with improving SMA students’ mastery of fixed expressions could not be well exposed to students in order for them to learn. Take, for instance, Munandar (2012), Salam (2013), Faris (2014), Noviyanti (2015), Kinasih (2014), Al-Munawwarah (2015), Darrin (2014), Noviyanti (2015), Gailea (2013), Sholihah (2016), Kartini (2015), Zikria (2014), Panjaitan (2013), Caroline & Winardi (2014), Rima (2010), Anggraini (2009), Hafidhoh (2011), Chasanah (2011), Rusdin (2014), Sukriawati (2008), Fitria (2011), and Sorohiti (2005) who have analyzed the content of textbooks for SMA students in Indonesia. Their focus was not on investigating whether or not formulaic competence-related materials had been developed in those textbooks.

Research Problem and Objective

Indonesian Ministry of Education published SMA English textbooks to be used all over Indonesia. All of the textbooks were published both in printed version and in digital version. That was a good program because the students could download the books from the Internet free of charge. The government also distributed the books to all senior high schools where students could borrow them both to be used at school and to be learnt at home after school hours. Unfortunately, as what the teachers said in the preliminary study, the textbooks were still far from meeting the expectation in terms of containing the materials needed by teachers and students particularly the materials related to formulaic expressions.

English has been taught in all Indonesian schools as a foreign language, but one of its learning-teaching goals is to enable the students to communicate in English. The condition is, however, the SMA students remain to face the same problem. Rarely are they able to communicate in English both in written and in spoken communication. This problem has been rooted in their grammar competence and vocabulary mastery particularly their mastery of fixed or prefabricated expressions in English. Thus, providing the students with English textbooks which contained the formulaic expressions is pivotal.

It can be briefly stated that in order for the students to be able to promote their communicative competence, their formulaic competence should also be good. This need should have been contained in the books that they have for their learning-teaching at school.
Because the preliminary study result demonstrated that teachers have not been using the SMA textbooks as their solely sources for teaching, it was believed that the English textbooks had disregarded the materials related to formulaic competence. Referring to this case, it is considered very important to investigate to what extent have the SMA English textbooks have comprised the aforesaid topics. Thus, this study aims to investigate to what extent have the English textbooks published by the Indonesian Education Ministry for SMA students all over Indonesia designed or developed the materials regarded with formulaic competence and what the impact of disregarding this language component will be for SMA students’ English competence. It is expected that the result of this study will benefit SMA students in their learning, SMA teachers in their teaching, SMA textbook writers in their book writing, and the government in their decision making related to textbooks development.

**Review of Literature**

A language functions as a communicative medium in people’s daily communication (Aronoff & Rees-Miller, 2008, p. 250). This view implies that material development for English teaching-learning should consider the function the materials contained in the textbooks. Fixed expressions or formulaic expressions such as chunks and collocations are, then, advised to be contained in any material development for SMA students. Regarding with this point, Celce-Murcia (1995) proposes some types of competencies to achieve communicative competence, one of which is formulaic competence.

The definition of formulaic competence is stated by Celce-Murcia (2007) that it is a type of competence dealing with the mastery of aspects of a language regarded with fixed expressions that speakers of a language often use in their day-to-day communication. These expressions are not based on grammar rules, but they are prefabricated. They can be in the form of chunks or collocations. Such expressions can be in the form of chunks or collocations. Expressions like yes of course, all of a sudden, during the day, at night, in the meantime, for the time being, it’s not likely that, it’s been a long time since..., in my opinion..., How are you doing, by the way, at the end are categorized as fixed or prefabricated language expressions people usually use in their daily communication.

In regard with chunks, Tomlinson (2011) argues that chunks are phrases or a group of words that always exist together but have only one meaning. This means that students needs to be exposed to such types of expressions through the materials provided in the textbooks. Take for an example, instead of saying meanwhile, students can use the formulaic expression in the meantime in their communication. The importance of chunks for the students to learn is stated by Weinert (1995) that chunks can be viewed as a strategy of communication which allows the students to keep communicating when they lack grammatically-based expressions. In this case, the students who lack grammatically-correct sentences can still produce communicative expressions for their communicative needs. Because students in Indonesia do not acquire these chunks automatically in their life, they need to learn them from the textbooks.

The contribution of formulaic chunks in English learning is also proposed by Myles & Mitchell (1999) who argue that formulaic chunks developed in an English textbook for the classroom learning-teaching is very substantial in helping the learners to be able to communicate even though they lack grammatical-based sentences. It is reinforced by Haerazi et al. (2020) who inform that formulaic expressions used in writing indicate learners have good creative thinking skills in utilizing linguistic features in their communication. Besides, Aprianoto and Haerazi (2019) conduct a speaking assessment in which they place formulaic expression as one of speaking assessment components in teaching speaking skills.

The concept and the important function of formulaic chunks are also argued by Allan (2009), who says that chunks or lexical chunks are two more words which often exist together
The impact of disregarding formulaic ………

which is pragmatically meaningful regardless of their syntax. Chunks play a fundamental role in obtaining native-like English competence. So, English textbooks as one of the main sources for learning-teaching process should contain the chunks-connected materials for useful input. This research is then important to be done to see to what extent have chunks-related materials been covered in Indonesian SMA English textbooks. A similar idea dealing with the importance of chunks is also supported by Girard & Sionis (2004) with the argument that daily communication also relies on prefab chunks of a language that are important for the students to learn and to keep up with their real time communication.

Collocations as part of formulaic expressions are also important to be contained in English material development for SMA students. In regard with collocations, Brown et al. (2003), Celce-Murcia (2007), and O’Dell & McCarthy (2008) argue that collocation refers to a group of words which frequently occur together. Some of collocations are prefabricated in that they have fixed expressions: a word only collocates with a word but cannot collocate with other words. The word “take”, for instance, collocates with the phrase “a photo” so that there is a collocation “take a photo”. Other types of collocations are freer. This means that a word can be collocate with more than one word or phrase. The phrase “the rules” can collocate to the phrase “keep to” or “stick to”, so that there can be collocations such as “keep to the rules” or “stick to the rules”.

The notion about collocations is also proposed by Nesselhauf (2003), who argues that collocations refer to a combination of words which are very important to be learnt. This idea implicitly indicates that collocations in English communication are so important that they should be prepared in the materials such as English textbooks used by the students for their English learning process at school. Students, in this context, SMA students in Indonesia need to learn and understand collocations so that they can improve their English in enhancing their English accuracy and fluency. Collocations according to Biel, Biernacka, & Jopek-bosiacka (2018) are “a regular co-occurrence of lexical units, or more specifically with reference to legal language, as a co-occurrence of a term (which functions as a node) with other linguistic elements referred to as collocates”.

It is undeniable that collocations are fundamental for the students to learn. As argued by Fan (2009) that students need to have collocations knowledge to allow them to be able to communicate in English friendly and to speak more like a native speaker. In order to achieve this competence, the students need to be provided with collocation-related materials in the English textbooks that they have at school for the learning process. Without such materials in their textbooks, they can only learn English with grammar-rule-based sentences. It is in this context that prefab expressions such as chunks and collocations as the components of formulaic competence are necessary to be investigated so that the coming edition of the aforementioned English textbooks will be much better. This point closely connects with the importance of an English textbook for students in learning English at school.

Almost in all schools all over Indonesia English textbooks still play an important role as the main source of materials in the learning-teaching process. This condition is even much more crucial in more remote areas in Indonesia where have no access to the internet to find more additional learning materials. Thus, providing an English textbook with as complete content as possible is deniable. All materials needed to be learnt by students including prefab expressions should then be contained in the textbooks that they use at school.

RESEARCH METHOD

This study belongs to qualitative content analysis with the objective of investigating the SMA English textbooks provided by the Indonesian Ministry of Education to be used by all SMA students in Indonesia. It is necessary to reveal whether or not such English textbooks written based on the prevailing 2013 Curriculum meet what students need in their learning
process particularly the materials regarded with prefab expressions or formulaic components of English materials in a textbook.

To manage and analyze the data for this study, NVivo 12 Plus was used. This qualitative software was used because it was very good for qualitative data management and analysis (Bazeley, 2000; Edwards-Jones, 2014; Woolf & Silver, 2017). The NVivo 12 Plus software for this research was used in the stages of data coding, data verification, data cleaning, data query, and data analysis.

The analysis in this research focused on the materials connected with the formulaic expressions and the impact of neglecting them in the textbook material development. It was such points that became the unit of analysis in this study. Talking about the unit of analysis in content analysis research, (Zhang & Wildemuth (2005) say that the fundamental part of a text to be categorized and analyzed is the unit of analysis. Unit of analysis is different from unit of context, in that the later refers to the set limits of written texts needed to be investigated such as words (GAO, 1989). For the context of this study, the unit of context was the content of SMA English textbooks in which the prefab expressions should have been contained.

The objects of this study were the materials connected with formulaic competence which included chunks and collocations. These points were considered important to be prepared for the students in the textbooks for SMA students. By this case, such textbooks became the data sources for this content analysis research. Such aforesaid textbooks are the SMA English textbooks developed based on 2013 Curriculum and published by the Indonesian Ministry of Education for use all around Indonesia by SMA students. Such books are: Bahasa Inggris SMA/MA/SMK/MAK X (Utami Widiati et al., 2017), Bahasa Inggris SMA/MA/SMK/MAK XI (Mahrukh Bashir, 2017), and Bahasa Inggris SMA/MA/SMK/MAK XII (Utami Widiati et al., 2018). These textbooks were published in the form of electronic textbooks that students can freely download from the internet. The government also provided the textbooks by distributing them to all senior high schools nationwide.

Gathering the data for this study was done by using document analysis technique. Thus, for the sake of this study, the documents used were in the form of English textbooks for SMA written based on 2013 Curriculum as mentioned above. The researcher became the main instrument for data collection in this study. The reason was that, as argued by Croker (2009, p. 11), a researcher is responsive, anticipative, and adaptive to the data sources and the setting of the study. This implies that a researcher as a data collection instrument is dependable. Besides, direct observation and NVivo 12 Plus were also used as data collection instruments. The NVivo 12 Plus was used when managing all the data obtained directly from the sources before the data were further analyzed.

To get the trustworthiness of this study that comprises credibility, confirmability, dependability, and transferability, Kappa Statistic Test in NVivo 12 Plus, thick and rich data depiction, and audit trail were used. Kappa Statistic Test was with the assistance of NVivo 12 Plus software to achieve the reliability agreement level of the data coding. For this purpose, two data coders coded the same data. Their coding result was then compared and tested with Kappa Statistic Test which is already in NVivo 12 Plus. The agreement and disagreement of data coding of the two coders were compared, the result of which should be based on the standard of Kappa Reliability Test based on what has been determined by Fleiss, Levin & Paik (2003). Below is the Kappa Reliability Test standard.

| Poor agreement |  ≤ 0.40 |
| Fair to good agreement | 0.40 – 0.75 |
| Excellent agreement |  > 0.75 |
If the inter-coder reliability test result is less than 0.40, it means that the reliability is poor, and if the test result is 0.40 – 0.75 it means that the reliability is fair or good, and if the test result is more than 0.75 it implies that the reliability is excellent.

The data analysis technique used in this study was document analysis technique. To actualize this goal, the queries program in NVivo 12 Plus were used. The brief procedure is: first, the data collected from the sources were imported to NVivo 12 Pluss where all the data were coded; second, all of the data which have been coded categorically were analyzed. All of the processes of coding and analyzing the data were on the basis of the findings of in the data collection and data management in NVivo 12 Plus. The queries program in NVivo 12 Plus assisted the researcher to manage, analyze, and display the data analysis results. This study also implemented cross-case analysis technique in analyzing the data. This was done by comparing data findings related to the prefab expressions-related content of the data sources.

**RESEARCH FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

The findings of this study revealed that the three selected SMA English textbooks developed the materials regarded with to formulaic expressions, prefab chunks and collocations. The findings connected with prefab chunks are presented in Figure 1 below.

![Figure 1:Prefab Chunks in SMA English Books X, XI, & XII](image)

Figure 1 above demonstrates that the SMA English textbooks analyzed in this study have contained the materials for the students to learn the prefab expressions such as fixed phrases or chunks. However, as seen in Figure 1 above, the number of materials connected with such prefab expressions is insignificant. Insignificance of material number in this context means that there are less formulaic expressions-related materials in the three textbooks compared to the other materials for the students to learn other components of English.

The insignificant number of materials for the students to learn prefab expressions or fixed expressions influences both SMA English teachers in teaching English and the SMA students in learning English either at school or at home. The impact for the teachers was that they had to fine additional English sources to be used to teach their students. The SMA English teachers who found the lack of prefab-expressions-related materials in the textbooks used other relevant English materials to cover up the lack of the SMA English textbooks. The negative effect of such insignificance of prefab materials for the students was that they could not be maximally exposed to those aforesaid expressions. This condition brought about the impact that SMA students could not well improve their formulaic competence, which in the end made them unable to communicate well in English especially in spoken communication.

Besides the insignificant number of prefab materials, the three SMA English textbooks also contained imbalanced number of prefab materials from Grade X book until Grade XII book. As seen in Figure 1 above, of the total topics presented in the textbooks, Grade X Book only contained 19 pieces of materials or 7.09% of the whole content of the textbook. Meanwhile, Grade XI Book contained 30 topics or parts or about 18.75% of the total number
of topics prepared in the textbook. The last textbook, Grade XII Book, only contained 6 pieces of materials or about 3.24% of the total content of the textbook.

The imbalance of content dealing with the prefab expressions in the textbooks implies that there was no well-prepared textbook writing template. This implies that there was no discussion among the writers to make the template of the textbook content similar. Ideally, the material coverage for prefab expressions such as chunks or fixed phrases should have been balanced from a book to another book. The impact of this condition was, once again, that SMA English teachers had to add more relevant materials for the students to learn (Haerazi & Irawan, 2020). Otherwise, the learning-teaching goal could not be well achieved. For the students, it impacted on their learning flow due to the lack of related materials particularly in Book X and XII. Thus, it is suggested that the English textbook series for future revised edition contain or prepare the prefab materials.

The prefab expressions such as that’s great, good luck, well done, congratulations, I hope you will, I hope so, why don’t you, how about, I don’t think so, if you say so, that’s a good idea, I do appreciate it, that would be wonderful, I can do it myself, etc. are necessary to be contained in the textbooks. With the prefab expressions like above, students get used to being exposed to the materials and they are used to using them in their daily communication both at school and outside their school.

Like the findings related to prefab chunks of formulaic expressions, the textbooks also contained the materials for the collocations. The findings regarded with collocations in the three selected English textbooks are presented in Figure 2 below.

Figure 2: Collocations in SMA English Books X, XI, & XII

Figure 2 above clearly presents that the three SMA English textbooks indeed contain the collocations. However, similar to the chunk-related materials, there was insignificant number of materials contained in the three textbooks. For instance, Book X contained 16 collocation-related materials. Book XI provided more materials related to collocations than the other two books did, namely 27 topics related to collocations. Book XII provided only 12 parts related to collocations in the textbook.

As what happened to chunks mentioned earlier, the insignificant number of collocation-related materials impacted on both teachers and students. To cover up this material deficiency in the three textbooks, SMA English teachers needed to get extra materials so that students need for collocation materials could be fulfilled. SMA students also face the same problem. They could not use the textbooks as the only their learning source due to the lack of related materials.

The content of the three textbooks also lacked balanced material provision. This implies that each textbook has different coverage of collocation materials. Book X, for example, has only 16 topics about collocations or about 5.97% of the total content of Book X. This percentage is lower than that of in Book XI which has 27 topics about collocations or
more or less 16.88% of the total content of Book XI. The lowest percentage of collocation materials was found in Book XII, that is, only 12 topics about collocations or about 6.49% of the total content of Book XII.

The insignificant number of collocation materials and the imbalanced provision of materials from one textbook to the next textbook grade indicate that there was no uniformity in terms of textbook-content template. This case certainly caused the students and teachers to find their own extra or additional materials or English textbooks to fulfil what they needed. If they did not do this, they could not achieve the competence related to formulaic competence materials, the negative effect of which was that teachers could not provide the students with sufficient materials for formulaic competence and the students could not improve their vocabulary mastery. When they failed to achieve such goals, students’ communicative competence in general and formulaic competence in particular could not be achieved.

Thus, it is advised that the collocations such as attend a meeting, attend college, mother tongue, give your hand, take you home, in order to, in order that, piece of cake, etc. need to be contained in the textbooks. The target is that the more the SMA students are exposed collocations the more they will be like native speakers in using English in their real life. If Indonesian SMA students are not accustomed to collocations, they will only learn English not for communicate purpose but for knowledge orientation.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

On the basis of the findings and analysis above, it can be concluded that the three selected English textbooks designed for SMA students in Indonesia still lack the materials for formulaic competence purpose. The lack of the materials for formulaic competence was not only in relation to the insignificant number of the materials in each textbook but also in connection with the imbalanced provision of prefab expressions from one textbook to another textbook. The impact of this condition was that teachers were forced to find their own additional materials for formulaic competence. The students could not enhance their English competence particularly in terms of formulaic competence.

Referring to the facts about the content of the three SMA English textbooks above, some suggestions are worth stating here. First, the materials for the students to learn prefab expressions such as chunks and collocations need to be provided sufficiently so that teachers and students especially the ones in remote areas in Indonesia do not need to look for additional materials for their teaching and learning. This is very important because finding more additional materials in remote areas in Indonesia is not as easy as doing the same thing in big cities where the internet can be easily accessed. Second, the textbook writing template should be well prepared. If the writers could make the same template of their textbook writing, the material coverage in each textbook would be balanced. Thus, there will be no textbook that lack certain language components but abundantly provide other language aspects in each textbook.

REFERENCES


The impact of disregarding formulaic ………..


Haerazi, H., & Irawan, L. (2020). The effectiveness of ECOLA technique to improve reading comprehension in relation to motivation and self-efficacy. *International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning (IJET)*, 15(01), pp. 61-76. doi: [http://dx.doi.org/10.3991/ijet.v15i01.11495](http://dx.doi.org/10.3991/ijet.v15i01.11495)


