THE EFFECT OF SHOW AND TELL, ROLE-PLAY AND STORYTELLING ON SPEAKING SKILLS: META-ANALYSIS

1Enma Oktaviani, 1Ilham, 1Lukman, 2Samson Olusola Olatunji, 3Nicole Whitworth
1Department of English Education, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, University Muhammadiyah of Mataram, Indonesia
2Department Linguistic Immersion Centre, University of Ilorin, Nigeria
3School of Education Department, Faculty Member, Leeds Beckett University, United Kingdom

Corresponding Author Email: ilham.ummataram@gmail.com

Abstract

Show and tell, role-play, and storytelling are all enjoyable speaking practice approaches for educators to utilize when teaching English. Therefore, the goal of this study is to assess the efficacy of the Show-and-Tell, Role-Play, and Storytelling methods for improving English speaking skills. The results of this study were obtained using JASP software, and 60 research findings met the criteria for the analysis, which shows a significant statistical impact from the three speaking approaches. In the Show-and-Tell method, the effect size value was 1.09 (High Effect), in the Role-Play method it was 1.13 (Very High Effect), and in the Storytelling method it was 1.34 (Very High Effect). However, Storytelling has a greater impact than the other methods. Furthermore, this study suggests that research published in 2022 has the largest effect, with 1.371 (Very High Effect). Meanwhile, analyzing the number of participants, it is clear that a study with more than 52 persons has the biggest impact, with an estimated value of 1.257 (Very High Effect). Among the methods, Story-Telling had a higher influence than the other methods in teaching English speaking skills. In conclusion, this meta-analysis provides strong evidence supporting the effectiveness of the Show-and-Tell, Role-Play, and Story-Telling methods in teaching English speaking skills. The findings underscore the need for educators to incorporate these methods into their pedagogical strategies to enhance students’ English speaking skills.

INTRODUCTION

English as a foreign language is formally taught in Indonesian schools from elementary school through university (Daud, 2022). If learners or students wish to succeed in mastering the language, they must be able to achieve competence in the four basic language skills listening, speaking, reading, and writing(Jannah & Trilestari, 2020). In the English language learning subject, speaking skills are taught to empower each student to increase their capacity to communicate verbally fluently, and accurately (Aisyah et al., 2021).Speaking is one of the skills that enable understudies to learn communication in English(Adhiyta & Mivahuljanah, 2022). Communicative Speaking is an essential component of the language learning process. It is also to help students’ capability to use language well(Qomariyah, 2023). Students can express their thoughts by speaking to instructions, requests, arguments, stills, or opinions (Carolina et al., 2022). Speaking is essentially a skill in reproducing the flow of the articulation sound system to convey desires, needs, feelings, and desires to others (Rumiasih et al., 2022). Speaking skills development entails building the learners’ capacity to
communicate and practice their articulation with good pronunciation (Gunadiputra et al., 2022). Learning speaking skills is the most important aspect of learning a second or foreign language and success is measured based on the ability to carry out conversations in the language (Rahmawati & Gusniwati, 2020). The goal of teaching English speaking skill is to improve the students' communication skills, to enable them to express themselves, and learn how to use the language (Hidayati, 2019).

However, many people believe that speaking is one of the most difficult English language skills. Speaking English can be difficult for English language learners, especially if they do not know the language well. The most common issue for learners is a lack of confidence in the English language (Kashinathan & Abdul Aziz, 2021). Actually, speaking English is difficult; the things that cause difficulty while speaking to pupils include poor reading habits and misunderstanding in applying grammatical rules (Baron, 2020). Furthermore, these competencies include skills that are difficult for EFL learners. They must be familiar with several crucial aspects such as pronunciation, grammar, vocabulary, fluency, and comprehension (Choirunnisā & Sari, 2021). Besides, EFL speaking is typically regarded as a difficulty for learners because it requires a significant amount of work to successfully use the language in real-time (Cabrera-Solano, 2020). Students may struggle to learn to speak because they come from diverse social and educational backgrounds, lack language training, and are too influenced by their mother tongue (Pratiwi et al., 2020). The most difficult aspect of speaking English for students is expressing suitable vocabulary. They rarely use English, and when they do, they have a moment to think about it. Moreover, they use the code-mixing method, involving conversing using both Indonesian and their mother tongue (Wahyuningsih & Afandi, 2020). In teaching speaking, teachers need to create an attractive learning atmosphere for the students to practice extensively, by using a variety of appropriate method such as; Show and Tell, Role-Play, and Storytelling approaches (Aulia Sri Wulandari et al., 2022).

Show and Tell method is one of the techniques that the researchers selected to help students enhance their speaking skills (Lestari, 2020). Show and Tell is a teaching technique in which students must show and tell or describe anything they bring to the classroom (Alvionita et al., 2022; Amrullah et al., 2023). Students utilized the "Show and Tell" method to practice speaking in front of the class by describing an object, using this method will involve students in the speaking activity in class and help them feel more confident by getting used to practice speaking (Salsabila et al., 2023). The application of the show-and-tell method has benefits, including helping to grow courage and passion in communicating in public (Apriyanto & Syakur, 2022). The show-and-tell technique is a learning strategy that tries to improve students' communication skills through a variety of student activities, including demonstrating, explaining, and describing something using an object such as photos/pictures, objects, and so on (Sazli, 2023). The Show and Tell method can attract and sustain students' attention in the learning process, because they have the freedom to choose any object they want, in the form of a favorite object or a souvenir object (Dewi & Subrata, 2021). The practice of using the Show and Tell method for learning to speak in English has been widely carried out (Fitriani, 2020; Manda et al., 2022; Japarunissa, 2022; Ulfa, 2018; Pusippita, 2021). Fitriani, (2020) for example conducted research at the high school level which discussed the effectiveness of the Show and Tell Method on the English-speaking ability of 35 students and obtained the results that the Show and Tell method was effectively used in English speaking ability and had a significant impact with a t-count of 19.248.

The use of Role-Play in English as a Foreign Language (EFL) contexts is highly recommended for arousing learners’ interest, confidence, preparation, and speaking comprehension in a fun way (Husniah, 2020). Role play is another strategy which motivates students to work together in pairs, help one another, and make the lesson more exciting and
decreasing boredom (Rokhman et al., 2020). The role-play can be used as a creative way to teach for improving speaking skills. It is a technique in which students have to assume either scripted or spontaneously imagined roles in different times and places (Alfina Dwiyanti, 2023). Role-play typically involves learners being provided knowledge about a "role" (for example, a person or a job title). Students take a little preparation time and then collect with other students to act out brief scenes utilizing their own ideas, as well as any ideas and facts from the role cards (Akmal, 2018). Role play can help students improve their speaking abilities by increasing confidence and exposing them to various situations in their daily life, using this approach enables teachers to communicate with students and make learning more enjoyable for them (Mulyana, 2020). Role-Play games are more effective in motivating students than Oral English tests and students' motivation may increase or decrease depending on the language learning context (Lutfi et al., 2018). The use of role-play method to teach speaking skills has also been widely conducted (Hasanah, 2020; Khasanah, 2022; Permatasari, 2023; Magfirah, 2021; Mazida, 2022). Khasanah, (2022) has conducted research discussing the effectiveness of the Role Play method on video English speaking skills with a total of 44 students and the results showed that there was a significant influence of employing the Role Play approach in teaching speaking skills with a t-count of 13,834.

Storytelling is one of the most powerful techniques to improve speaking skills (Falina, 2018). Researchers have been studying the use of Digital Storytelling to improve speaking skills among learners of English (James et al., 2019). Storytelling is the art of using language, pronunciation, body movements or gestures to reveal the elements and images of a story to a specific, immediate audience (Jannah & Trilestari, 2020). The effectiveness of employing Digital Storytelling as a teaching strategy to enhance students’ speaking abilities has been the subject of numerous studies up to this point (Astuti & Chakim, 2023). The techniques of Storytelling are conducive to the formation of imagination. Stories are very useful in developing young learners’ literacy, social, and emotional skills by manipulating the language (Doğan & Çifçi, 2021). The effects of Storytelling on learners’ first language literacy were extended to second language learning too, and some researchers and teachers use Storytelling techniques in teaching speaking and oral skills (Khodabandeh, 2018). (Agustina, 2018; Septiani, 2019; Damayanti & Anwar, 2019). Damayanti & Anwar, (2019) has conducted research discussing the effectiveness of the Storytelling method on video English speaking skills with a total of 60 students and obtained the results that there is a significant impact of using the Storytelling method in teaching speaking skills with a t-count of 5.327.

Therefore, the aim of this study is to find out the significance level of three methods for improving English speaking skills. In contrast with previous studies that only investigated one or two learning methods, this study will evaluate and contrast the effectiveness of three used learning methods: show and tell, role-play, and storytelling. Additionally, this study will implement the Meta-Analysis method to evaluate the effects of the three methods on improving speaking ability among various years and numbers of samples. It is expected that this study will determine which of all three methods is most successful and helpful for teaching students speaking skills. The findings of this research can help researchers in exploring the effects of Show and Tell, Role-Play, and Story Telling on improving speaking skills of a language.

**RESEARCH METHOD**

This research is a meta-analysis. A meta-analysis is a quantitative study, and given its characteristics, utilizes statistical calculation for a practical purpose, i.e., arranging and extracting information from many data where the process cannot be performed using other methods (Diner et al., 2021). The purpose of this meta-analysis study is to re-examine the findings of previous research or scientific publications on the use of show and tell, role play,
and storytelling methods in speaking learning. Data were obtained from indexing databases such as Google Scholar, DOAJ, and Scopus. The filtered data is the research results, including the Fisher test (F), student test (t), correlation test (r), and number of students (N), which are then analyzed using meta-analysis to determine the summary effect size (Mandailina et al., 2021).

The inclusion criteria (eligibility criteria) refer to the characteristics of population-related research based on level, year, and variables in relation to the effectiveness of the Show-and-Tell, Role-Play, and Storytelling methods in students' speaking ability development. This study employed a meta-analysis method, reviewing several articles from 2018-2023 that matched the title or keywords: Show-and-Tell, Role-Play, and Storytelling methods in speaking ability, using full English, and type of publication (article, journal, and thesis). Exclusion criteria are used to identify articles suitable for statistical analysis of a meta-analysis based on inclusion criteria. Exclusion criteria include research data such as the number of participants (N), error indicator percentages, Effect Size (ES), and Standard Error (SE) (Sari et al., 2023). The procedure research, according to Figure 1:

![Figure 1. The Procedure Research](image)

The data collection was done according to the following steps (Mansurah et al., 2021). Firstly, search for the keywords that will be used in the research and data are sourced from indexing databases including Google Scholar, DOAJ, and Scopus. Next, download the PDF file using the keywords and examine sample data from it, such as the author's name, the year of journal publication, the number of students (N), the Fisher test value (F), the student test (t), and the correlation test (r). Further, ensure that the JASP application is installed on the laptop and apply JASP software to analyze the data. Determine the analysis, findings, or output from the JASP software after that. Afterward, examine the findings from the publications that served as the references for the documentation. Lastly, make inferences based on the findings of the meta-analysis. Effect Size (ES) and Standard Error (SE) values determine the level of influence category which can be seen in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1. Classification of Glass's Effect Sizes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

JOLLT Journal of Languages and Language Teaching, April 2024. Vol.12, No.2 | 849
RESULT AND DISCUSSION
Data Selection Result

The data set search resulted in 87 data based on the inclusion and exclusion criteria. 60 data and 27 data did not meet the inclusion and exclusion criteria. The data collected in this research were the Fisher test (F), student test (t), correlation test (r), and number of research subjects (N). Meanwhile, method or media learning, as well as levels can be used in the process of discussion or further data analysis with certain additional provisions. The following is Figure 2 of the results of convection of F and t values to r values and convection of r values to ES and SE.

![Figure 2](image-url)

Figure 2. Results of Data Selection and ES and SE values

Figure 2 above contains 60 eligible data divided into 34 data from Show-and-Tell Method, 13 data from Role-Play Method, and 13 data from Story-Telling Method to teach speaking skills. Then from the 60 data there are 4 data from Negligible Effect, 5 data from Small Effect, 4 data from Moderate Effect, 6 data from High Effect, 1 data from Very High Effect and 40 data from High Influence. Next, the researcher conducted hypothesis testing and the publication bias test based on the data that had been obtained. In the Meta Analysis using JASP software seen in drawing conclusions are the z value and p value in the Coefficients table. The hypotheses are as follows:

Hypothesis 1: Show-and-Tell, Role-Play, and Story-Telling Methods are effective in improving student learning outcomes in speaking skills

Hypothesis 2: There is no publication bias from the data used in the research

In the first step, a heterogeneity test was performed to look at the category data, whether using fixed or random effects. The results are presented in table 2.
From the JASP results obtained on the Show-and-Tell, Role-Play and Story-Telling methods to teach English speaking skills, it can be seen that the data are heterogeneous with $Q = 577.227$ and $p$ value $<0.001$. Next, the estimated results on methods for teaching speaking skills in English are presented in table 3. The following are the estimated results of methods for teaching speaking skills in English according to table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>Z</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>intercept</td>
<td>1.176</td>
<td>0.065</td>
<td>18.228 &lt;.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In table 3 regarding coefficients, the $z$ score is 18,228 and the $p$ value is 0.001, which is smaller than the significance level of 5% (0.05). These results indicate that the hypothesis is correct. From the JASP results, the estimated value of all complete data in table 3 is 1.176 (Very High Effect) which shows that this method has a very big influence on students’ learning speaking outcomes which means that student learning outcomes are significantly influenced by the three methods, namely Show-and-Tell, Role-Play and Story-Telling in teaching English speaking skills. There is also a test for publication bias. This test was performed to determine whether the data collected can be considered representative of the general population. The results of rank correlation and regression tests can be used to evaluate this test. The output shown in table 4, table 5 and table 6 below comes from JASP results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kendall's $\tau$</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rank test</td>
<td>-0.333 &lt;.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>$z$</th>
<th>$p$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>sei</td>
<td>0.574 0.566</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>N</th>
<th>Target Significance</th>
<th>Observed Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>73420.000</td>
<td>0.050</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In Table 4 for rank correlation and regression, Kendall's value for the method of teaching English speaking skills is -0.333, which shows that there is a significant correlation coefficient between effect size and variance. In Table 5, the z value shows the regression coefficient of 0.574, and the p value of 0.566 is greater than the value of 0.001, which means the second hypothesis is not rejected. In other words, no publication bias was identified. Table 6 shows how many studies with an average effect size equal to 0 should be added to the research sample so that the research results are free from publication bias. In addition, this can also be proven by looking at the Funnel Plot in Figure 3 below.

![Funnel Plot](image)

Based on the results published in Figure 3 above, it can be seen that there are no missing studies marked as open circles, all are closed circles. In addition, from the Forest Plot image, the summary effect value is 1.18 (Very High Effect), meaning it has a very large effect or has a strong effect and it has been proven that the Show-and-Tell, Role-Play and Story-Telling in teaching English skills enhance student learning outcomes.

**The Influence of Speaking Skills in English Based on Method**

Moderator variable analysis is needed to determine how much influence Show-and-Tell, Role-Play and Story-Telling methods have on students’ speaking skills in English.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Q-Test</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>I² (%)</th>
<th>RE Model</th>
<th>Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Show-and-Tell</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>131.933</td>
<td>1.091</td>
<td>92.327</td>
<td>1.09[0.90, 1.28]</td>
<td>High Effect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Role-Play</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>66.502</td>
<td>1.132</td>
<td>90.205</td>
<td>1.13[0.86, 1.40]</td>
<td>Very High Effect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Story-Telling</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>126.610</td>
<td>1.338</td>
<td>85.070</td>
<td>1.34[1.10,1.57]</td>
<td>Very High Effect</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7 shows that the Show and Tell, Role Play, and Storytelling methods have a relatively strong influence on teaching English speaking skills. The estimate for the Show and Tell method is 1.091 (High Effect) with an I² value of 92.327, the Role Play method is 1.132 (Very High Effect) with an I² value of 90.205, and the Storytelling method is 1.338 (Very Influence High) with an I² value of 85.070. These findings indicate that Show and Tell, Role Play, and Storytelling all have a significant influence, but the storytelling approach has a
greater impact than the other methods. The researcher will then exhibit funnel plots for each approach, starting with Show and Tell, Role Play, and Storytelling, to demonstrate that the data in Table 7 are free of publication bias. Figures 4, 5, and 6 will show the plot effects of Show and Tell, Role Play, and Storytelling.

Based on Figures 4, 5 and 6, from the Funnel Plot, we can see that no publication bias was identified as all circles are closed. Furthermore, from the Forest Plot image from the Show and Tell Method, a summary effect value of 1.09 (High Effect) was obtained, the Forest Plot image from the Role Play Method had an effect value of 1.13 (Very High Effect) and the Storytelling Method had an effect value of 1.34 (Very High Effect). As shown in Table 7, the Effect Size of the Show and Tell Method is 1.09 (High Effect). Furthermore, the Effect Size value of the Role Play Method is 1.13 (Very High Effect). Finally, the Effect Size value of Storytelling is 1.34 (Very High Effect). Overall, it can be said that the use of these three methods has a very high influence on English speaking ability of students.
However, Storytelling has the highest level of effectiveness for teaching English speaking skills with an estimate of 1,338 (Very High Effect). The storytelling method is more effective than the other two methods because it fosters children's imagination and creativity, instills moral values at a young age, develops students' intellectual, affective, cognitive, and psychomotor aspects, reaches more children, and is cost effective. Furthermore, storytelling-based learning requires students to freely tell stories based on their reasoning, thinking, and imagination in order to explain outcomes or speaking abilities while remaining mindful of language and non-linguistic variables.

**The Influence on English Speaking Skills of Show and Tell, Role Play and Storytelling Methods Based on Moderator Variables**

At this stage, the authors analyzed the data to ascertain the impact of the number of participants and years of publication of on the effectiveness of the show-and-tell, role-play and story-telling methods on students’ English speaking skills learning outcomes JASP output is shown in the following table based on the number of participants and years of publication.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Interval</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Q-Test</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>$I^2$ (%)</th>
<th>RE Model</th>
<th>Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Publications Year</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>25.197</td>
<td>1.051</td>
<td>94.914</td>
<td>1.05[0.64,1.46]</td>
<td>High Effect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>38.146</td>
<td>1.017</td>
<td>89.463</td>
<td>1.02[0.69,1.34]</td>
<td>High Effect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2020</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>29.139</td>
<td>1.068</td>
<td>87.562</td>
<td>1.07[0.68,1.46]</td>
<td>High Effect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>113.040</td>
<td>1.260</td>
<td>87.850</td>
<td>1.26[1.03,1.49]</td>
<td>Very High Effect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2021</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>183.110</td>
<td>1.371</td>
<td>72.942</td>
<td>1.37[1.17,1.57]</td>
<td>Very High Effect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2022</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>39.171</td>
<td>1.198</td>
<td>94.383</td>
<td>1.20[0.82,1.57]</td>
<td>Very High Effect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2023</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>158.148</td>
<td>1.130</td>
<td>89.249</td>
<td>1.13[0.95,1.31]</td>
<td>Very High Effect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of</td>
<td>0-52</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>158.148</td>
<td>1.130</td>
<td>89.249</td>
<td>1.13[0.95,1.31]</td>
<td>Very High Effect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>228.138</td>
<td>1.257</td>
<td>89.441</td>
<td>1.26[1.09,1.42]</td>
<td>Very High Effect</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to Table 8, the Show-and-Tell, Role-Play, and Storytelling methods of teaching English speaking abilities have a substantial impact from 2018-2023. However, the greatest effect happened in 2022, with an effect size of 1.37 (Very High Effect) and a Q-Test score of 183.110. Because learning activities had returned to normal in that year, the outcomes appeared to be better than in the years before it (2018, 2019, 2020, and 2021), as previous years' learning activities had been less than optimal due to the COVID era, thus learning activities were online. This finding is consistent with earlier studies conducted by Yasmiatun et al (2022), which predict that the implementation of English speaking skills teaching methods will have a significant impact in 2022, with an effect size value of 1.472 (High Influence). Furthermore, more than 52 individuals had a significant impact, as evidenced by an effect size value of 1.26 (Very High Effect) and a Q-test value of 228.138. Data with more than 52 participants is supported by research (Diyanti, 2023) with an effect size value of 1.472 (High Influence), which falls into the high category and has a greater influence than data with fewer than 52 participants.
CONCLUSION

The aim of the research is to evaluate and compare the effectiveness of show and tell, role-playing, and storytelling methods for improving speaking skills. Based on the findings of this study, teaching English speaking abilities through the Show-and-Tell, Role-Play, and Storytelling methods is highly effective for developing speaking skills, with a "high effect" as shown in Table 8. These three methods have significant effects, but storytelling is more effective than the others, with an estimated effect of 1,338 (Very High Effect). Table 9 shows the influence of the three speaking methods based on the year of publication. It is obvious that in 2018, 2019, 2020, 2021, 2022, and 2023, they all come in the high category or have a significant impact. However, in 2022 it has a greater impact than in previous years, with an effect size of 1,371 (Very High Effect). In addition, researches with more than 52 participants have a large impact, as shown by an estimated effect size of 1,257 (Very High Effect). This suggests that, when utilized in a greater number of participants, the show and tell, role-play, and storytelling methods are highly successful at improving speaking skills.

This study has important implications for educators and developers of curriculum who want to increase language learning outcomes, especially in regards to English speaking skills, by utilizing three methods: show-and-tell, role-playing, and storytelling. Teachers and students use all three of these methods to help them develop social skills, express ideas and emotions, and become more active and creative learners, especially when learning to talk. Educators should consider changing their approach to create a more interactive and exciting learning experience, given its considerable influence. Furthermore, this study emphasizes the significance remaining updated on language teaching innovations and technology. This understanding can help educators development exciting methods of learning based on the resources available in teaching languages.

REFERENCES


Aulia Sri Wulandari, Genta Sakti, Veni Roza, & Irwandi. (2022). The Effect Of Show And Tell Method On Students’ Speaking Ability At Eighth Grade Of Mt's Diniyah Pandai
Oktaviani, E., & Fredy, E. (2023). The Effect of Show and Tell Strategy on Students’ Speaking Skills at The Eighth Grade of SMPN 1 Patikraja [State Institute on Islamic Studies Purwokerto]. https://repository.uinsaizu.ac.id/7425


Husniah, E. F. (2020). The Effect of Role Play Technique on Speaking Skill of The Second Grade Student of MTs Ma’arif NU KOTA Malang [University of Islam Malang].


Hasanah, S. U. (2020). The Influence of Joining English Club Toward Students’ Speaking Ability at 8 Grade of SMPN 1 Patikraja [State Institute on Islamic Studies Purwokerto]. https://repository.uinsaizu.ac.id/7425


Husniah, E. F. (2020). The Effect of Role Play Technique on Speaking Skill of The Second Grade Student of MTs Ma’arif NU KOTA Malang [University of Islam Malang].
http://repository.unisma.ac.id/handle/123456789/1027
Magfirah, I. (2021). *The Effect of Self Efficacy on Students’ Speaking Ability at SMPN 17 Makassar* [Bosowa University]. https://repository.unibos.ac.id/xmlui/handle/123456789/1863
Mazida, A. I. (2022). *The Effectiveness of Two Stray Two Stray Technique on Students’ Speaking Skill at SMPN 3 Ngroonggot Nganjuk* [State Institute of Islamic Studies Ponorogo]. https://repository.unibos.ac.id/xmlui/handle/123456789/1863


